MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE

CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION

000000000

CITY OF SOUTH PASADENA

CONVENED THIS 20TH DAY OF SEPTEMBER, 2018

AMEDEE O. "DICK" RICHARDS, JR. CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS
1424 MISSION STREET

ROLL CALL

The meeting convened at: 6:45 pm

Commissioners Present: Mark Gallatin (Chair), Steve Friedman (Vice-Chair), Rebecca Thompson, Victor

Holz

Commissioners Absent: Deborah Howell-Ardila

Council Liaison: Michael A. Cacciotti, Councilmember (absent)

Staff Liaison Present: Darby Whipple, Senior Planner

Please Note: These Minutes are a summary of the meetings and are not a fully transcribed record. An audio recording of the meeting can be made available

upon request with the City Clerk's Office.

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD

None

CONSENT CALENDAR - Brought Forward

9. 320 Grand Avenue | Koebig House (Landmark Nomination)

Applicant: William and Teresa Sherman, Owners

Project No.: 2123-LHD

Year Built: 1927

Architectural Style: English Tudor Revival

Historic Status Code: 2B2

Historic District: Grand Avenue North (Potential District)

City Landmark No.: N/A

Project Description:

The appointed Subcommittee will present their report to the full Commission in their support of the nomination of the Koebig House (320 Grand Ave) as a South Pasadena Historic Landmark. The Commission will determine the course of action upon review of the Subcommittee's report findings. If the Commission determines the nomination shall move forward, the Commission may schedule the formal recommendation to Council as the next scheduled CHC meeting, pursuant to a 20-day notice. The home was designed by architect H. Roy Kelley, in the English Tudor Revival style and was built in 1927-1928. The original owner was Walter C.S. Koebig, a prominent orthopedic surgeon in California.

Presentation:

Dr. William Sherman: Thanked the Commission and noted that he agreed with the subcommittee's report as written.

Public Comment:

No public comment.

Commission Discussion:

Commissioner Friedman: Spoke in favor of report

Decision:

Commissioner Friedman: Made a motion to recommend to City Council.

Commissioner Holz: Seconded the Motion

APPROVED

(Ayes: 4; No: 0), 1 Absent.

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD - Reopened

1. Glen Duncan – 2031 Berkshire gave a presentation on 1301 Chelton Way known as the Miltimore House designed by Architect Irvin Gill. The discussion introduced an upcoming Mills Act application through a preliminary Significance Document. The presentation provided handouts to the commissioners showing the interior of the home, rear sleeping porch and other exterior details.

CONSENT CALENDAR

2. 2024 Maycrest (Notice of Intent to Demolish)

Applicant: Mike Geragos Project No.: 2081-NID-DRX

Year Built: 1951 Historic District: N/A

Project Description:

The Cultural Heritage Commission will consider a request for approval of a proposal to demolish an existing 405 sq. ft. two vehicle garage. The existing structure is a 1,501 sq. ft. single story house located on a 7,505 sq. ft. lot. An Architectural Historian has provided a Historic Evaluation Report and has determined that the structure is not eligible as a designated Historic Resource. The Commission will review and validate the findings of the report in relationship to the proposed demolition as required for all structures proposed for demolition that are at least 45 years old and not currently on the City's Historic Inventory. If the CHC finds that the structure is not eligible as a Historic Resource, the project will proceed to the Design Review Board for the proposed replacement construction of a new 470 sq. ft. detached two vehicle garage and a 1,097 sq. ft. second story addition. The CHC will not be approving the proposed house addition and the new garage, only the demolition of the existing garage.

Commission Comment:

Commissioner Friedman requested discussion.

Presentation:

Mike Geragos discussed the garage and noted the Historic Resources Assessment which fails to recognize the garage as historically significant. Answering Commissioner Friedman, Mr. Geragos described the work proposed on the main structure which includes keeping the ground floor plan and work on the front wall (changing architectural style), deepened front door. A new second floor within a Spanish Style with a bull nosed plaster on windows with plaster sill, a two piece tile roof for a sensitive recreation.

Public Comment:

None

Commissioner Friedman: Asked what of the existing facade will be remaining.

Mr. Geragos noted that the ground floor wall location it will have new windows and second floor.

Commissioner Gallatin: Commented for absent commissioner Howell-Ardila felt the Saphos historic report could be used as a model.

No public comment.

Commission Discussion:

Commissioner Friedman: Not questioning the Historic Assessment Report, but referring to the Municipal Code for structures 45yrs old or older. A report is required for "any demolition" which includes more than razing a structure to the ground, the report only addresses the garage. Noting the definition includes destruction or removal in whole or in part of any physical structure.

Commissioner Gallatin: Paraphrased to say that the scope of work exceeds a simple remodel and asked staff to provide clarity on what constitutes demolition.

Decision:

Commissioner Friedman: Made a motion to continue.

Commissioner Holz: Seconded the Motion

APPROVED

(Ayes: 4; No: 0), 1 Absent.

CONTINUED ITEMS

3. 1963 La France Avenue

Applicant: Charles Yu Project No: 2091-COA

Year Built: 1909

Architectural Style: Mission Revival

Historic Status Code: 5D1

Historic District: La France Craftsman District (Potential District)

Project Description:

The Cultural Heritage Commission will consider a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a proposal for 456.50 sq. ft. single story addition and a new 384.25 sq. ft. second story addition to an existing 2,188 sq. ft., two story Mission Revival style house on an 8,662 sq. ft. lot. The single story addition will consist of a living room and a bedroom. The second story addition will consist of a bedroom with a bathroom. A 123 sq. ft. second story deck is proposed on the rear elevation. All of the proposed additions are located on the rear elevation. The exterior materials for the additions will match the existing. The materials will consist of stucco siding, flat roof, and vinyl windows.

Presentation:

Mr. Yu summarized the requested corrections made on the plans based on the Commission's recommendations.

Public Comment:

None

Commission Discussion:

No questions. Commissioner Gallatin pointed out window size errors (sheet A4), doors not drawn with glazing on drawings. Commissioner Thompson noted building code errors and recommended code review.

Suggestion to staff to record covenant as SFD.

Decision:

Commissioner Gallatin: Made a motion to approve. Meets Specific Findings #2, #3, #5, and #6

Commissioner Friedman: Seconded the motion

APPROVED

(Ayes: 4; No: 0), 1 Absent.

NEW ITEMS

4. 1954 Milan Avenue

Applicant: Scott Brown Project No: 2140-COA Year Built: 1910

Architectural Style: Craftsman Historic Status Code: 5D1

Historic District: South Milan District (Potential District)

Project Description:

The Cultural Heritage Commission will review a request for the proposal to demolish an existing 462 sq. ft. accessory structure/garage and the proposal of a 462 sq. ft. single story addition to an existing 1,794 sq. ft. two story Craftsman style house on a 10,010 sq. ft. lot. A new 600 sq. ft. three vehicle garage with an attached 200 sq. ft. pool-house is proposed. The addition will consist of a new master bed room, a master bathroom, a master closet, and a mudroom. The exterior materials for the addition will match the house materials.

Applicant Presentation:

Mr. Brown summarized plan corrections based on the Commission's suggestions and Structural Engineer's report of condition of structure; no foundation, termite damage, etc.

Commission Questions:

Commissioner Gallatin clarified details on plans regarding windows, board and batten, and sink in garage. Details of interior to be worked out at plan check. Commissioner's Gallatin and Thompson discussed differentiating the addition with some detailing. Details of the garage from the applicant would include standing seam roof, wood windows and wood siding; representing a style of "Japanese Tea House" overall.

Public Comments:

No Public Comments.

Commission Discussion:

Discussed the structural report in relation to garage and the lack of need for an Historic Resource Evaluation report for replacement.

Decision:

Commissioner Thompson: Made a motion to APPROVE the project as submitted. The project meets Specific Findings #1, #2, and #6.

Commissioner Friedman: Seconded the motion.

APPROVED

(Ayes: 4; No: 0), 1 Absent.

5. 1017 Avon Place

Applicant: Mark Ng Project No: 2152-COA

Year Built: 1911

Architectural Style: Craftsman Historic Status Code: 5D1

Historic District: 1000 Block Avon District (Potential District)

Project Description:

The Cultural Heritage Commission will review a request for the proposal of a 442 sq. ft. single story addition to an existing 1,512 sq. ft. single story Craftsman style house on a 6,750 sq. ft. lot. The addition will consist of a new bed room, two bathrooms, a closet, and a laundry room. The exterior materials for the addition will match the existing house. The existing trees will be removed; therefore, A 27" Avocado Tree and a 20" Victorian Box Tree will be planted. Please contact the Public Works Dept. at 626/403-7240 for additional information.

Applicant Presentation:

Joseph Bracamonties (owner) summarized changes to plans from conceptual review in previous CHC meeting, including window changes from sliders to casement.

Commission Questions:

Commissioner Thompson requested the re-use of casement windows that open into the house in the "nook" near the back door. Suggested re-use behind the sink in lieu of the current window that will end up below counter height, as drawn. Commissioner Gallatin recommended re-use of existing casement windows in bedroom #4 in place of proposed new casement and fixed.

Public Comments:

No Public Comments.

Commission Discussion:

Agreement on plans.

Decision:

Commissioner Holz: Made a motion to APPROVE.

Commissioner Thompson: Seconded the motion adding condition to try to re-use casement windows

APPROVED

(Ayes: 4; No: 0). 1 Absent.

6. 2011 Mission Street

Applicant: Lisa Henderson Project No: 2154-COA

Year Built: 1927

Architectural Style: English Revival Bungalow

Historic Status Code: 5D1

Historic District: Southeast Mission Craftsman District (Potential District)

Project Description:

The Cultural Heritage Commission will review a request for a proposal, regarding a 576 single story and a new 397 second story addition to an existing 1,428 sq. ft. single story English Revival Bungalow style house on an 8,047 sq. ft. lot. The single story addition will consist of a family room, a kitchen, and a dining area. The second story addition will consist of two bedrooms and one bathroom. The exterior materials for the addition will match the existing house materials. The existing garage will be relocated towards the rear of the property. The permitted 378 sq. ft. accessory structure will be demolished.

Applicant Presentation:

Lisa Henderson (Harvest Architecture), for applicants, made a description correction to include removal of 378 square foot accessory structure "playhouse" and 327 square feet of rear additions; she then describes history of construction on site and future construction plan.

Public Comment:

No public comment.

Commission Questions:

Commissioner Thompson: question about eaves of existing. The applicant answered that she would like to match the previous.

Commissioner Gallatin: On window schedule there is a correction needed between casement vs double hung (on West side)... it should be a casement. Also asked for clarity on HVAC location and that second story setback is applicable per SPMC.

Commission Discussion;

No further discussion.

Decision:

Commissioner Holz: Made a motion to APPROVE The project meets all the Mandatory Findings along

with Specific Findings of: 1, 2, & 6. Commissioner Gallatin: Seconded

(Ayes: 4; No: 0), 1 Absent

7. 191 Marengo Ave

Applicant: Kyle Imoto Project No: 2157-COA

Year Built: 1910

Architectural Style: Craftsman Historic Status Code: 5D1

Historic District: La France Craftsman District (Potential District)

Description:

The Cultural Heritage Commission will review a request for the proposal for a 340 single story and new 798 second story addition to an existing 1,487 sq. ft. single story Craftsman style house on a 7,511 sq. ft. lot. The single story addition will consist of a great room. The second story addition will consist of two bedrooms, a bathroom, a master bedroom, master bathroom, a master closet, and a laundry area. The exterior materials for the addition will match the existing house materials. This item will be continued to the October 18th CHC meeting. **A new notice will be posted**.

8. 1115 El Centro Street | South Pasadena Library

<u>Landmark Nomination for the Library Tree (Subcommittee Report to Commission)</u>

Applicant: Library Director, Steve Fjeldsted

Project No.: 2155-LHD Year Planted: 1930

Natural Feature: Moreton Bay Fig Tree

Historic Status Code: N/A

Historic District: Library Neighborhood (Potential District)

City Landmark No.: N/A

Commission Questions/Discussion & Applicant Response:

No Discussion

Decision:

Commissioner Gallatin: Made a motion to recommend to City Council

Commissioner Holz: Seconded the motion

APPROVED

(Ayes: 4; No: 0), 1 Absent.

Discussion Items

10. Review of Current Mills Act Contracts:

Project Description:

The Cultural Heritage Commission shall review the progress made towards the completion of preservation work stipulated in the Mills Act contracts that are scheduled for review this year and Mills Act contracts that are 10 years or older, per SPMC 2.68(b)(1)(E)(iii) Responses to notices for Mills Act recipients are forthcoming and due before the next scheduled meeting on November 15th, 2018 **This item is for discussion purposes only; no decision shall be made at this time.**

Presentation:

Staff summarized the requirement for 3yr progress reports of existing Mills Act contracts.

COMMUNICATIONS

11. COMMENTS FROM COUNCIL LIASON:

No comments.

12. COMMENTS FROM COMMISSION:

Commissioner Thompson: Summarized a talk about Mills Act Contracts she gave to WISPPA (Women Involved in South Pasadena Political Action)

Commissioner Gallatin: Recounted presentation as guest speaker at Rotary meeting.

13. COMMENTS FROM SOUTH PASADENA PRESERVATION FOUNDATION (SPPF)

Commissioner Gallatin: Noted final EIR (Environmental Impact Report) for 710 freeway by CalTrans forthcoming and proposed plans for former CalTrans properties.

14. COMMENTS FROM STAFF:

Staff noted that a new Interim Planning and Building Director, David Bergman, has been brought on.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

15. No minutes to review.

ADJOURNMENT

16. The meeting adjourned at 8:30 pm to the next regularly scheduled meeting on October 18, 2018.

APPROVED,	
much Hallati	February 22, 2019