

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE  
**CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION**

CITY OF SOUTH PASADENA

CONVENED THIS 17<sup>TH</sup> DAY OF JANUARY, 2019

AMEDEE O. "DICK" RICHARDS, JR. CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS  
1424 MISSION STREET

## ROLL CALL

The meeting convened at: 6:50 pm

Commissioners Present: Mark Gallatin (Chair), Rebecca Thompson (Vice Chair), William Cross, Kristin Morrish

Commissioners Absent:

Council Liaison: Michael A. Cacciotti, Councilmember (absent)

Staff Liaison Present: Darby Whipple, Senior Planner

*Please Note: These Minutes are a summary of the meetings and are not a fully transcribed record.  
An audio recording of the meeting can be made available upon request with the City Clerk's Office.*

## PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD

1. NONE

## CONSENT CALENDAR

2. 1422 Alhambra Road (Notice of Intent to Demolish)

*Applicant: James Fenske*

*Project No.: 2179-NID-DRX*

*Year Built: 1923*

*Historic District: N/A*

### **Project Description:**

The Cultural Heritage Commission will consider a request for a CHC consent approval for a proposal to demolish an existing 400 square foot detached two-car garage and significant alteration to the existing single-family home. The primary residential structure consists of an existing single-story Craftsman-Style home of approximately 1,382 square feet. The applicant is proposing to add a second story to the residence, and construct a new detached 500 square foot garage. The new second floor addition will be 977 square feet for a total of 2,359 square feet for the primary structure. Additionally, the applicant is proposing a façade change to convert the architectural styling to a Mediterranean style architecture. An Architectural Historian has provided an Historic Evaluation Report and has determined that the structure is eligible as a designated Historic Resource. The Commission will review and validate the findings of the report for the purposes of the proposed demolition as required for all structures proposed for demolition that are at least 45 years old and not currently on the City's Historic Inventory. If the CHC approves of the demolition, the project will proceed to the Design Review Board for the proposed addition and façade change subject to compliance with current City Zoning standards.

### **Commission Comment and Discussion:**

Commissioner Thompson called the item forward.

Applicant Jim Fenske was asked to present the project. Mr. Fenske summarized the points in the Historic Resources Group (HRG) report contending the property does not meet the requirements for designation as an historic resource. Mr. Fenske also noted the current deteriorated condition of the property per multiple property inspections.

Owner Sulekh Suman summarized the time of the process and noted the current condition of the property; specifically that it is uninsurable in its current state.

Commissioner Thompson asked Mr. Fenske about the changes that were made to the design when presented to Design Review Board. Mr. Fenske explained that the first design was simple, but DRB asked for a more detailed design, to which the plans were updated.

Commissioner Gallatin asked staff to describe the demolition standards. Sr Planner Whipple noted that when 50% of the exterior features are proposed for removal on structures exceeding 45yrs old, the project follows the “demolition” standards prescribed in the Ordinance.

Commissioner Morrish requested clarification on the Historic Resource Evaluation consultant selection process. Staff explained that proposals are requested by staff from among qualified consultants and chosen based on proposal responses.

**Public Comment:**

None

**Decision:**

Commissioner Morrish: Made a motion for a finding that the structure is not significant.

Commissioner Thompson: Seconded the motion.

***APPROVED***

(Ayes: 4; Naye: 0), 1 Vacancy.

**Discussion Items**

**12. Voting on Current Chair and Vice Chair**

**Project Description:**

The commission will nominate and appoint a Chair and Vice Chair for the 2018-2019 year.

**Commission Comment and Discussion:**

Commissioner Gallatin selected as Chair. Commissioner Thompson selected as Vice Chair.

***APPROVED***

(Ayes: 4; No: 0), 1 Vacancy

**CONTINUED ITEMS**

**3. 1314 Stratford Avenue**

***Applicant: Thomas Agius***

***Project No: 2166-COA***

***Year Built: 1914***

***Architectural Style: Craftsman***

***Historic Status Code: 5D1***

***Historic District: Marengo School Craftsman District (Potential District)***

**Project Description:**

The Cultural Heritage Commission will review a request for the proposal for a 135 single story and new 954 second story addition to an existing 1,664 sq. ft. single story Craftsman style house on a 7,915 sq. ft. lot. The single story addition will consist of a family room and bedroom. The second story addition will consist of a bedroom, a bathroom, a master bedroom, master bathroom, and two closets. The exterior materials for the addition will match the existing house materials. A 105 sq. ft. addition is proposed to the existing 336 sq. ft. detached garage. The new garage size will be 500 sq. ft. The exterior materials for the garage addition will match the existing.

**Commissioner Recused**

Gallatin

**Commission Comment and Discussion:**

Applicant Thomas Agius introduced the owners in the audience and summarized the project, noting a requested change from the previous hearing.

Commissioner Morrish asked for a clarification that the window schedule show if windows would be True Divided. The applicant confirmed they were not proposing true divided lights.

Commissioner Thompson asked of the commissioners if the proposal to cut back the stairs (making room in driveway) was a concern. The commissioners and applicant discussed limiting the work to the stairs only and taking great care to match the new concrete work to the old.

**Public Comment:**

None

**Decision:**

Commissioner Cross: Made a motion to APPROVE

The project meets Specific Findings #2, #3, and #4,

Commissioner Morrish: Seconded the motion.

***APPROVED***

(Ayes: 3; No: 0), 1 Vacancy, 1 Recused.

**NEW ITEMS**

4. **800 Fair Oaks Avenue**

***Applicant: Richard Kim***

***Project No: 2190-COA***

***Year Built: 1911***

***Architectural Style: Classical Revival***

***Historic Status Code: 5S1***

***Historic District: N/A***

**Project Description:**

The Cultural Heritage Commission will review a request for the proposal for 5 new awning signs. All the awnings will be Forest Green with white “Gillsans” 5” font lettering. The three awnings on Hope Street will read, “KJ TOFU HOUSE” “KOREAN BBQ” “BIBIMBAP”. The two awnings on Fair Oaks Avenue will read “KJ TOFU HOUSE” and “KOREAN BBQ”. The proposed awning design will match the existing adjacent awnings. Outdoor dining is also proposed on Fair Oaks Avenue and Hope Street. The outdoor dining requires an Administrative Use Permit which is reviewed and approved by staff. The outdoor dining also requires an encroachment permit from the Public Works Dept.

**Commissioner Recused**

Morrish

**Commission Comment and Discussion:**

Owner Richard Kim gave a summary of the proposed awnings describing that only the fabric will be changed, the existing framing to remain.

Commissioner Gallatin confirmed with staff that no Master Sign plan applies to the application.

**Public Comment:**

None

**Decision:**

Commissioner Gallatin: Made a motion to APPROVE  
The project meets Specific Findings #6, #7, and #8  
Commissioner Thompson: Seconded the motion.

***APPROVED***

(Ayes: 3; No: 0), 1 Vacancy, 1 Recused.

**5. 1228 Milan Avenue**

***Applicant: Susan Masterman***

***Project No: 2198-COA-MOD***

***Year Built: 1917***

***Architectural Style: Spanish Colonial Revival***

***Historic Status Code: 4D2***

***Historic District: N/A***

**Project Description:**

The Cultural Heritage Commission will review the proposal for the modification to a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness (2121-COA, May 2018). The applicant is proposing to square off the second story addition with a 240 square foot bedroom addition. The materials for the additional will match the existing. The project, as previously approved, is currently in the construction framing stage two.

**Commission Comment and Discussion:**

Applicant/Architect Susan Masterman noted the addition of pages A-1.3 and A-4.3 to correct window schedule as well as summarized the project. The request is being made to correct a previous design including flat roofs and parapet walls which have caused water damage to the historic structure.

Commissioner Thompson asked for an explanation of the proposed use of roofing tile over horizontal elements of the rear roofline which seem to cover some of the “Prairie” aspects of the homes former design. Ms. Masterman explained that the proposed design continued elements from the front of the house and existing roof lines.

Commissioner Gallatin commented on the change from 5 windows to 3 on the 2<sup>nd</sup> floor, use of casement windows vs existing double hung. Ms. Masterman noted the number of windows was driven by structural sheer transfer concerns while the style change was in keeping with the remainder of the “new” work vs introducing an additional window style.

**Public Comment:**

None

**Decision:**

Commissioner Morrish: Made a motion to APPROVE

The project meets Specific Findings #6, #7, and #8

Commissioner Cross: Seconded the motion.

***APPROVED***

(Ayes: 3; Naye: 1), 1 Vacancy.

**6. 1920 Mill Road**

***Applicant: Barrett Cooke***

***Project No: 2182-COA***

***Year Built: 1924***

***Architectural Style: English Revival***

***Historic Status Code: 5D3***

***Historic District: North Milan District (Potential District)***

**Project Description:**

The Cultural Heritage Commission will review the proposal for a 414 sq. ft. single story addition to an existing 1,164 sq. ft. single story English Revival house on a 7,682 sq. ft. lot. The addition will consists of a new master bedroom and bathroom. The exterior materials will match the existing house. A 15” diameter grapefruit tree is to be removed. Please contact Public Works Department for more information at 626-403-7240, regarding the tree.

**Commission Comment and Discussion:**

Applicant/Architect Barrett Cooke gave a summary of the project noting that the project and first been previewed to CHC in October.

Commissioner Gallatin asked to have the site details clarified against assessor data. The discrepancy is being addressed by the applicant with the assessor. Currently the discrepancy does not affect proposed lot coverage or FAR calculations.

Commissioner Thompson asked for clarification on the sight line drawing. The applicant explained it was a requirement from staff. Staff explained that the ordinance asks for the depiction of a 45 degree angle from the front lot line and that submittal requirements include a site line from both sides of the street; although not useful in this case; it is asked of all second story additions.

Commissioner Thompson also asked for clarification on the new door at the side entrance as drawn; suggesting the door be considered to be changed to the same style as the new proposed French doors vs mimicking other doors on the home.

Commissioner Morrish asked if staff would clarify the Historic Status Code (5D1 vs 5D3) on the plans vs CHC cover sheet. Staff confirmed the status code is 5D3.

**Public Comment:**

Walter Cervantes (neighbor 1921 Mill Rd) spoke in support of the project, but voiced concern about construction traffic and parking along the street.

Owner, Daniela Bleichmar, described her family's request to expand for the family of four.

**Decision:**

Commissioner Morrish: Made a motion to APPROVE

The project meets Specific Findings #2, #5, and #6

Commissioner Thompson: Seconded the motion.

***APPROVED***

(Ayes: 4; Naye: 0), 1 Vacancy.

**7. 181 Monterey Road**

***Applicant: Jeffrey Su***

***Historian: Jenna Snow (Presenter)***

***Project No: 2188-COA***

***Year Built: 1946***

***Architectural Style: Minimal Traditional***

***Historic Status Code: 5S3***

***Historic District: N/A***

**Project Description:**

The Cultural Heritage Commission will review the consider a request to de-list a Minimal Traditional style home at 181 Monterey Rd from the City's Inventory of Cultural Resources (the "Inventory"). An architectural historian has analyzed the potential impacts of de-listing 181 Monterey Rd from the Inventory as part of the City contracted CEQA process for a proposed project on site and determined that this action would not have an impact to the environment because the house does not appear eligible under any of the 11 criteria of the South Pasadena Cultural Heritage Ordinance (SPMC 2.63b). Furthermore, when listed on the South Pasadena Inventory of Historical Resources no

survey form was prepared to support specific findings. A mitigated Negative Declaration is being prepared for the subsequent project.

**Commission Comment and Discussion:**

Sr. Planner Whipple (Staff) introduced the project noting that a 15 unit residential project is proposed across parcels 181, 185 and 187. The review of the properties at 181-187 Monterey Road were required as of the pending CEQA Mitigated Negative Declaration underway by the City. Being that the home at 181 Monterey Rd is on the City’s Historic Inventory, the applicant is requesting that it be de-listed to expedite demolition before proceeding with development plans. The remaining properties will come before the CHC for a request of a finding of “Not Significant” for properties more than 45 years old, continuing to the Planning Commission for project review.

Jenna Snow (Historian) summarized the Historic Resource Evaluation Report that demonstrates the property does not meet any of the City’s 11 required findings for designation as an historic resource.

Commissioner Thompson asked for clarification as to why 181 Monterey Road was included on the City’s inventory and neither of the other two (185-187 Monterey Road) similar properties. No reasoning could be identified, as no Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) form has been recorded for the property.

**Public Comment:**

None

**Decision:**

Commissioner Gallatin: Made a motion to RECOMMEND for De-Listing to the City Council  
The Commission makes the Finding “The cultural resource lacks significance as defined under national, state, and local criteria for significance”  
Commissioner Morrish: Seconded the motion.

***APPROVED***

(Ayes: 4; Naye: 0), 1 Vacancy.

**Discussion Items**

**9. 2010 Oxley Street**

*Owner: Jennifer Troutoux*

*Applicant: Kelly McCloud*

*Project No.: 2183-COA*

*Year Built: 1908*

*Architectural Style: Craftsman*

*Historic Status Code: 5D1*

*Historic District: N/A*

**Project Description:**

The applicant is requesting feedback from the Commission regarding a 940 sq. ft. addition for the first and second floor to an existing 1,289 single story house on an 8,006 sq. ft. lot.

**Commission Comment and Discussion:**

Owner Jennifer Troutoux introduced the project and the Architect. Architect Kelly McCloud summarized the project.

Commissioner Gallatin clarified that there be a required second story side setback of three foot beyond the first floor per SPMC (36.220.050(B)(2)). Staff confirmed that requirement. Commissioner Gallatin further requested details on the window schedule of manufacturer and materials, as well as, what type of “divided light” will be proposed. A request for a 3D model or Sketch-up rendering be provided.

#### **8. Certified Local Government (CLG) Annual Report for 2017-2018**

##### **Project Description:**

The Commission will review a draft annual report that identifies all of the City’s Historic Preservation activities for the reporting period of October 1, 2017 through September 30, 2018. The annual report is submitted to the State Office of Historic Preservation in compliance with the City’s participation in the Certified Local Government Program.

##### **Commission Comment and Discussion:**

None

#### **10. Formation of Subcommittee**

##### **Project Description:**

Forming a subcommittee to study potential historic district South of Grevelia St, bordered by Brent Ave, Park Ave, encompassing Palermo Ln

##### **Commission Comment and Discussion:**

Commissioner Thompson and Morrish were appointed to the subcommittee.

#### **11. Existing Subcommittees**

##### **Project Description:**

Discussion for appointing subcommittee members to replace former commission members.

##### **Commission Comment and Discussion:**

Discussion about the existing subcommittees for the review of work at Rialto Theatre and the study of a potential historic district on Rollins Street. Commissioner Cross volunteered to join the subcommittee on Rollins Street. Commissioner Morrish volunteered to join the subcommittee for the Rialto Theatre.

## **COMMUNICATIONS**

#### **13. COMMENTS FROM COUNCIL LIASON:**

No comments.

#### **14. COMMENTS FROM COMMISSION:**

Commissioner Gallatin announced Council Member Joe will be the newly appointed Council Liaison  
Commissioner Gallatin summarized an upcoming California Preservation Foundation workshop on February 15th at the South Pasadena Library.

Commissioner Gallatin asked for an update on commission training in February as it is finalized.



**15. COMMENTS FROM SOUTH PASADENA PRESERVATION FOUNDATION (SPPF):**

Commissioner Gallatin also noted that the South Pasadena Preservation Foundation responded to the EIS for the 710 Freeway regarding inclusion of tunnel alternative in the future.

**16. COMMENTS FROM STAFF:**

Planning and Building Interim Director Bergman thanked the commission for their service. Gave a brief summary of future plans including technical support and proposed projects.

Sr. Planner Whipple followed up on a question regarding Historic Plaques for Landmark sites.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

17. Approval of Minutes (Sept. 20, 2018; Oct 18, 2018; Oct. 23, 2018; Dec. 20, 2018) CONTINUED to the next meeting.

**ADJOURNMENT**

18. The meeting adjourned at 9:45 pm to the next regularly scheduled meeting on February 21<sup>st</sup>, 2019.

<p>APPROVED,</p>  <p>_____</p>	<p>February 22, 2019</p> <p>_____</p>
---	---------------------------------------