MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION CITY OF SOUTH PASADENA Thursday, September 15, 2022 at 6:30 P.M.

AMEDEE O. "DICK" RICHARDS, JR. CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS 1424 MISSION STREET AND VIA ZOOM TELECONFERENCE

ROLL CALL

The meeting convened at:	6:30 pm
Commissioners Present:	Mark Gallatin (Chair), Conrado Lopez (Vice-Chair), William Cross, Kristin Morrish, and Rebecca Thompson
Staff Present:	Angelica Frausto-Lupo (Community Development Director), Matt Chang (Planning Manager), Susana Martinez (Associate Planner), Sandra Robles (Associate Planner), Braulio Madrid (Associate Planner) and Mackenzie Goldberg (Assistant Planner)

Please Note: These Minutes are a summary of the meetings and are not a fully transcribed record.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Approved 5-0.

DISCLOSURE OF SITE VISITS AND EX-PARTE CONTACTS

Commissioner Morrish disclosed that she is the next-door neighbor to the property owner of Item 7 on tonight's agenda – 1648 Spruce Street, Project No. 2489-NID/DRX.

PUBLIC COMMENT

1. <u>Public Comments – General (Non-Agenda Items)</u> None.

CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS

- 2. Minutes from the Regular Meeting of April 15, 2021.
- 3. Minutes from the Regular Meeting of June 17, 2021.

Vice-Chair Lopez motioned, seconded by Commissioner Thompson, to approve the minutes.

Approved 5-0 (Commissioner Morrish was not present for the June 17, 2021 meeting).

PUBLIC HEARING

4. <u>1024 Meridian Avenue, Project No. 2426-COA – A Certificate of Appropriateness</u> to construct a new 1,913 square-foot, two-story, single-family dwelling with an attached 432 square-foot garage and a 1,238 square-foot basement. The subject property is a non-contributor to the designated South of Mission Historic District.

Recommendation:

Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness, subject to the Conditions of Approval.

Presentation:

Associate Planner Sandra Robles presented a PowerPoint presentation.

Planning staff received one public comment before noon today and one after 12 p.m.

Questions for Staff:

Vice-Chair Lopez asked staff about the replacement or relocation of the palm tree at the front of the property and the front yard setback in comparison to other properties on the same street.

Commissioner Cross inquired about the number of skylights on the roof and the potential for solar panels in the future.

Chair Gallatin asked staff to elaborate on why the basement does not count towards floor area ratio (FAR).

Associate Planner Robles explained that the FAR calculation is determined from exterior wall to exterior wall – and as it is completely subterranean and not a habitable space.

Chair Gallatin asked if anything within the South Pasadena Municipal Code provided for a waiver of parking requirements based on the close proximity to transit.

Associate Planner Robles responded that currently there are no regulations within the Municipal Code that would allow a waiver for parking due to the close proximity to transit. However, the property has proposed an accessory dwelling unit. Therefore, a parking garage requirement does not apply.

Chair Gallatin invited the applicant to address the Commission with regard to the front setback question.

Questions for Applicant:

The architect, Steve Dahl, remarked that the goal was to be compatible with the neighborhood and blend in. The project is set farther back than required by Code. He indicated that the skylights are completely flat and in a dark tone to blend in with the roof materials and there is plenty of room around them for solar panels. He also discussed the basement.

Public Comments:

None.

Commissioner Discussion:

The Commissioners agreed that the visual cohesiveness of the district was maintained with the addition of this new house and concurred that it is a very good design requiring a few minor tweaks.

Decision:

Commissioner Morrish motioned, seconded by Vice-Chair Lopez, that the project be approved as submitted. The mandatory findings can be made, as well as Project Specific Finding number two (2), (it is appropriate to the size of the neighborhood), Finding number five (5), (it adds substantial new living space) and Finding number seven (7), (it does not adversely affect the character of the historic district), subject to the Conditions of Approval.

Staff conducted roll call:	
Commissioner Cross	Yes
Commissioner Morrish	Yes
Commissioner Thompson	Yes
Vice-Chair Lopez	Yes
Chair Gallatin	Yes

Motion carried, 5-0.

5. <u>610 Meridian Avenue, Project No. 2450 COA – A Certificate of Appropriateness</u> to add a 420 square-foot first-floor addition to the rear of an existing 1,314 square-foot, one-story, single-family dwelling.

Recommendation:

Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness, subject to the Conditions of Approval.

Presentation:

Associate Planner Braulio Madrid presented a PowerPoint presentation.

Questions for Staff:

Commissioner Cross inquired about the bay window correction on the plans and the Code requirement for the side yard setback.

Public Comments:

None.

Questions for Applicant:

Commissioner Morrish asked about the differentiation between the new proposed addition and the existing structure. Associate Planner Madrid responded that the differentiation will happen mainly between the new and existing materials - utilizing modern windows and leaving the existing original windows and the original siding in place.

Commissioner Thompson, Vice-Chair Lopez and Chair Gallatin expressed concerns regarding the lack of detail on the drawings, including the windows (trim and whether or not double hung), and the materials to be used.

Public Comments:

None.

Designer Julio addressed the Commission and apologized for the errors in the drawings and provided additional window information.

Commissioner Discussion:

Chair Gallatin outlined the options for the Commission with regard to next steps for the project.

The Commissioners discussed the detail lacking in the application and the drawings submitted, especially with regard to the windows, and recommended continuation of the project to the next regularly scheduled meeting.

Decision:

Vice-Chair Lopez motioned, seconded by Commissioner Morrish, to continue the project to the next regularly scheduled meeting on October 20th.

Staff conducted roll call:Commissioner CrossYesCommissioner MorrishYesCommissioner ThompsonYesVice-Chair LopezYesChair GallatinYes

Motion carried, 5-0.

6. <u>1705 Diamond Avenue, Project No. 2494 COA – A Certificate of Appropriateness</u> to add a 192 square-foot second-floor addition to an existing 2,044 square-foot, two-story, single-family dwelling.

Recommendation:

Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness, subject to the Conditions of Approval.

Presentation:

Associate Planner Susana Martinez presented a PowerPoint presentation.

Questions for Staff:

Chair Gallatin inquired about an editing remark on the documents referencing the parking requirements.

Applicant Presentation:

Architect Steve Dahl addressed the Commission.

Questions for Applicant:

Vice-Chair Lopez asked about the roofline. Chair Gallatin remarked about the comment made about delisting the property, the north elevation wall and adding windows to the second floor.

Public Comments:

None.

Applicant Rebuttal:

None.

Commissioner Discussion:

The Commissioners discussed differentiation, the airplane bungalow pop-up feature and using materials to differentiate between new and existing.

Decision:

Commissioner Morrish motioned, seconded by Vice-Chair Lopez, that the project be approved as submitted. Findings numbers 2, 3 and 5 can be made, provided that there is some differentiation made on the addition to the second floor (at the architect's discretion, followed by a Chair Review) to show that it is an addition, and the Finding that the non-conforming garage is original can be made.

Staff conducted roll call:	
Commissioner Cross	Yes
Commissioner Morrish	Yes
Commissioner Thompson	Abstain
Vice-Chair Lopez	Yes
Chair Gallatin	Yes

Motion carried 4-0, with one abstention.

7. <u>1648 Spruce Street, Project No. 2489-NID/DRX – A request for a Notice of Intent to Demolish</u> for

partial demolition of the front façade and rear of an existing single-family dwelling and a 684 square-foot detached garage.

Recommendation:

Approve the Notice of Intent to Demolish and determine that the property does not meet the national, state, or local criteria for historic designation and the project may proceed through the City's application process without any further restrictions under the Cultural Heritage Ordinance.

Presentation:

Associate Planner Susana Martinez presented a PowerPoint presentation.

Questions for Staff:

Chair Gallatin pointed out a few corrections to the local history of South Pasadena in the HRE report.

Applicant Presentation:

None.

Questions for Applicant:

The Commissioners reviewed the information and photographs regarding the garage.

Public Comments:

None.

Applicant Rebuttal:

The homeowner confirmed that the garage was a big space, initially used as a two-car garage and later the third bay was converted to some sort of living quarters.

Commissioner Discussion:

The Commissioners commended the HRE report and staff report and concurred with the findings of the reports.

Decision:

Chair Gallatin motioned, seconded by Commissioner Morrish, to recommend approval of the demolition of this structure so that they can proceed to the next step in the process.

Staff conducted roll call:	
Commissioner Cross	Yes
Commissioner Morrish	Yes
Commissioner Thompson	Yes
Vice-Chair Lopez	Yes
Chair Gallatin	Yes

Motion carried, 5-0.

ADMINISTRATION

8. <u>Comments from Council Liaison</u>: None.

9. Comments from Commissioners:

Commissioner Cross commented on an email received regarding an author who will be presenting her book on Paul Williams, the first FAIA Black architect in California. on October 4th at the library. If you are interested in architecture, he had a fabulous career, including the Beverly Hills Hotel. A really seminal architect, a great Los Angeles architect, a great California architect, a great American architect.

Commissioner Morrish asked about any updates regarding the Rialto project.

10. Comments from Subcommittees:

None.

11. Comments from South Pasadena Preservation Foundation (SPPF) Liaison:

Chair Gallatin announced that this Sunday is the Irving Gil Garden Gala. Tickets were still available on the website. They sold about 168 tickets, exceeding the target of 150. The event will include a live auction, a silent auction, gourmet luncheon and the Miltimore House open to the public for the first time on Sunday from 11:00 am to 5:00 pm.

12. Comments from Staff:

Director Frausto-Lupo reported that with regard to the Rialto project, a response was received to the letter sent earlier this year. She will follow up.

The third draft of the Housing Element was submitted to HCD today. The public draft was released a week ago. Based on the stipulated court order, HCD has 45 days (rather than 60 days) to respond.

Director Frausto-Lupo introduced Mackenzie Goldberg, Assistant Planner, the newest staff member. The Planning Counter Tech position is out right now. The minutes from a year ago continue to be updated and the department continues to move projects forward.

The City of South Pasadena is hosting an Open House on Sunday, October 2nd from 10:00 am to 2:00 pm. The community is invited to come out and join us. Every department will be on hand.

The California Preservation Awards are coming up next month on October 20th, which is the date of the next regularly scheduled meeting. The City of South Pasadena is receiving an award for the *Guidebook for ADUs on Historic Properties*. If the Commission would like to keep the meeting as regularly scheduled and not attend, there is a free virtual presentation on October 27th.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 8:36 pm to the next regular meeting of the Cultural Heritage Commission on October 20, 2022 at 6:30 pm.

APPROVED,

h Vallat

Mark Gallatin Chair, Cultural Heritage Commission 5-3-23

Date