

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION

CITY OF SOUTH PASADENA

April 20, 2023 at 6:30 P.M.

AMEDEE O. "DICK" RICHARDS, JR. COUNCIL CHAMBERS
1424 MISSION STREET

ROLL CALL

The meeting convened at: 6:30 pm

Commissioners Present: Mark Gallatin (Chair), Conrado Lopez (Vice-Chair), William Cross, Kristin Morrish, and Jeremy Ding

Council Liaison: Evelyn G. Zneimer, Mayor Pro Tem

Staff Present: Alison Becker (Deputy Community Development Director), Matt Chang (Planning Manager), Braulio Madrid (Associate Planner), Mackenzie Goldberg (Assistant Planner)

Please Note: These Minutes are a summary of the meetings and are not a fully transcribed record.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Approved, 5-0.

DISCLOSURE OF SITE VISITS AND EX-PARTE CONTACTS

Commissioner Cross drove by each property listed on the agenda. Chair Gallatin drove by 1119 Windsor Place (Item 4) and last month drove by 1716 Wayne Avenue (Item 5).

PUBLIC COMMENT

1. Public Comments – General (Non-Agenda Items)

None.

PRESENTATION

2. Updates from the City Manager's Office – Deputy City Manager Domenica Megerdichian

Deputy City Manager Megerdichian shared updates from the City Manager's office.

CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS

3. Minutes from the Regular Meeting of September 15, 2022

Commissioner Morrish moved, seconded by Vice-Chair Lopez, to approve the minutes.

Commissioner Cross	Yes
Commissioner Morrish	Yes
Commissioner Ding	Abstain
Vice-Chair Lopez	Yes
Chair Gallatin	Yes

Approved, 4-0-1.

- 1119 Windsor Place, Project No. 22-07-ADU** – A request to convert a 497 square-foot detached garage into an Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) at the rear of an existing 1,466 square-foot, single-family residence for the property located at 1119 Windsor Place (APN: 5315-005-042). In accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the project qualifies for a Categorical Exemption under Section 15301, Class 1 (Existing Facilities).

Recommendation:

Continue to a future meeting date to be determined.

Public Comment:

Staff received two (2) public comments for this item.

Decision:

Commissioner Morrish moved, seconded by Vice-Chair Lopez, to continue this item to a future meeting date to be determined.

Commissioner Cross	Yes
Commissioner Morrish	Yes
Commissioner Ding	Yes
Vice-Chair Lopez	Yes
Chair Gallatin	Yes

Approved, 5-0.

CONTINUED ITEM

- 1716 Wayne Avenue, Project No. 2481-COA** – A Certificate of Appropriateness to add a 702.5 square-foot, two-story addition to an existing 1,902 square-foot two-story single-family residence located at 1716 Wayne Avenue (APN: 5321-010-003). In accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the project qualifies for a categorical exemption under Section 15301, Class 1 (Existing Facilities) and Section 15331, Class 31 (Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation).

The item was continued from the regularly scheduled March 16, 2023 Cultural Heritage Commission meeting. The Applicant has provided revised elevation plans and seeks input from the Commission.

Recommendation:

Review and provide comments on the revised elevation plans. Continue this item to the May 18, 2023 Cultural Heritage Commission meeting.

Presentation:

Associate Planner Madrid presented a PowerPoint presentation.

Applicant’s Presentation:

None. However, the Applicant was available in Chambers and the project designer was available on Zoom.

Questions for Staff:

None.

Questions for Applicant:

The Commissioners and the homeowner discussed the windows.

Public Comment:

None.

Discussion:

Chair Gallatin commended the Applicant and designer for incorporating suggestions from the Commission’s previous meeting. He expressed concern about the transition between the old and the new and the synthetic roofing material selected. The Applicant was encouraged to refer to the City Design Guidelines.

The Commissioners suggested that the proposed design needed improvement and decided a subcommittee should be created to assist the homeowners with the project.

Decision:

Chair Gallatin moved, seconded by Commissioner Morrish, to form a subcommittee of Vice-Chair Lopez and Commissioner Ding. This item will be continued to the May 18, 2023 Cultural Heritage Commission meeting.

Commissioner Cross	Aye
Commissioner Morrish	Aye
Commissioner Ding	Aye
Vice-Chair Lopez	Aye
Chair Gallatin	Aye

Motion carried, 5-0.

Vice-Chair Lopez informed the Commission that he would not be available for the May 18, 2023 meeting.

PUBLIC HEARING

- 6. **1507 Rollin Street, Project No. 2550-COA** – A Certificate of Appropriateness to add a 363 square-foot first-floor addition, and a new 983 square-foot, second floor addition, and a 282 square-foot patio to an existing 2,043 square-foot, one-story, single family residence for the property located at 1507 Rollin Street (APN: 5319-005-018). In accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the project

qualifies for a Categorical Exemption under Section 15301, Class 1 (Existing Facilities) and Section 15331, Class 31 (Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation).

Recommendation:

Find the project exempt from CEQA pursuant to Sections 15301 and 15331. Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness, subject to the Conditions of Approval.

Presentation:

Assistant Planner Goldberg presented a PowerPoint presentation.

Questions for Staff:

The Commissioners expressed concern that there were no windows in the addition on the east elevation.

Chair Gallatin asked about items labeled on the plans differently than the staff report. Assistant Planner Goldberg explained the appropriate corrections would be made.

Applicant Presentation:

None. However, the Applicant was present in the Chamber.

Questions for Applicant:

Chair Gallatin asked about several discrepancies between the plans and the staff report, including: the lot coverage of the ADU; the proposed percentages on the hardscape vs. landscape calculations; and information regarding a door on the first floor that was neither labeled nor keyed to the door schedule. In addition, there were suggestions to consider an alternative when replacing the bathroom window above the shower; to introduce windows or cantilever to the east elevation; to reduce the plate height to eight (8) feet on the addition; and to consider the use of 3-D modeling or a computerized fly around to provide a more three-dimensional sense as to how the house relates to the neighborhood.

Vice-Chair Lopez and the Architect discussed the modification of the existing chimney and adjusting the drawings accordingly.

Public Comment:

None.

Applicant Rebuttal:

None.

Commission Discussion:

Commissioner Morrish commented that perhaps the east elevation is intentionally solid because it faces a large multi-family development.

Vice-Chair Lopez commended the Applicant and discussed several issues, including the rear elevation, the scale and volume, and the Hardie shingles. He also asked if the Fibrex windows were true divided lites.

Vice-Chair Lopez also mentioned a belly band, although he would not make that a requirement.

Vice-Chair Lopez suggested inclusion of a 3-D image to be required for all second story additions.

Commissioner Cross concurred with Vice-Chair Lopez’s comments.

After discussion, the Commissioners decided to list their recommendations as Conditions of Approval and for any changes providing a conflict, to review them at a Chair Review level.

Decision:

Commissioner Morrish moved, seconded by Commissioner Ding, to approve this project as submitted, with the Conditions of Approval. Those items that were discussed that are not just drawing errors will be reviewed by a Chair Review. All of the mandatory findings can be made - Project Specific Finding No. 2., the Project is appropriate to the size of the neighborhood; No. 3., there is a clear distinction between the new and existing home; and No. 5., it adds substantial extra space to the homeowner.

Chair Gallatin asked Staff for a Roll Call vote:

Commissioner Cross	Yes
Commissioner Morrish	Yes
Commissioner Ding	Yes
Vice-Chair Lopez	Yes
Chair Gallatin	Yes

Motion carried, 5-0.

ADMINISTRATION

7. Comments from Council Liaison:

None.

8. Comments from Commissioners:

Chair Gallatin shared that he attended virtually a session at the California Preservation Foundation Conference, a hybrid presentation this year – an in-person conference in San Francisco with some sessions being live streamed. He attended *Conquering Deterioration Planning or Deferred Maintenance in Historic Buildings*. Tomorrow, he will attend *Equity and Social Justice through Preservation*, which has case examples from Altadena and Santa Barbara. The virtual conference continues next week, Wednesday, Thursday and Friday. In addition, he will be attending the American Planning Association’s virtual conference Wednesday, Thursday and Friday of next week.

9. Comments from Subcommittees:

None

10. Comments from South Pasadena Preservation Foundation (SPPF) Liaison:

None.

11. Comments from Staff:

Deputy Director Becker applauded the presentation of a comprehensive report on the activities of the City given by Deputy City Manager Megerdichian. She commended the Commissioners for running a very efficient meeting.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 8:43 pm to the next regular meeting of the Cultural Heritage Commission on May 18, 2023 at 6:30 pm.

APPROVED,



10-23-23

Mark Gallatin
Chair, Cultural Heritage Commission

Date