

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE  
**CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION**

CITY OF SOUTH PASADENA

**July 20, 2023 at 6:30 P.M.**

AMEDEE O. "DICK" RICHARDS, JR. COUNCIL CHAMBERS  
1424 MISSION STREET  
SOUTH PASADENA, CA 91030

## ROLL CALL

The meeting convened at: 6:30 pm

Commissioners Present: Mark Gallatin (Chair), Conrado Lopez (Vice-Chair), William Cross, Kristin Morrish and Jeremy Ding

Staff Present: Alison Becker (Community Development Deputy Director), Braulio Madrid (Associate Planner) and Mackenzie Goldberg (Assistant Planner)

*Please Note: These Minutes are a summary of the meetings and are not a fully transcribed record.*

## APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Approved, 5-0.

## DISCLOSURE OF SITE VISITS AND EX-PARTE CONTACTS

Commissioner Cross drove by and took photographs of the sites included on tonight's agenda.

## PUBLIC COMMENT

1. **Public Comments – General (Non-Agenda Items)**

None.

## CONSENT CALENDAR ITEM

2. **Minutes from the Regular Meeting of December 15, 2022**

Approved, 4-0; 1 Abstention (Commissioner Ding).

## CONTINUED ITEM

3. **1716 Wayne Avenue, Project No. 2481-COA** – A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to add a 702.5 square-foot, two-story addition to an existing 1,902 square-foot two-story single-family residence located at 1716 Wayne Avenue (APN: 5321-010-003). In accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the project qualifies for a Categorical Exemption under Section 15301, Class 1 (Existing Facilities) and Section 15331, Class 31 (Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation).

This item was continued from the regularly scheduled June 15, 2023 Cultural Heritage Commission meeting.

**Recommendation:**

Continue this item to a future Cultural Heritage Commission meeting date to be determined.

**Presentation:**

Staff recommended that the Commission continue this item to an unspecified date.

**Decision:**

Commissioner Ding moved, seconded by Vice-Chair Lopez, to continue the hearing for 1716 Wayne Avenue to a future date to be determined, which will require new noticing.

Chair Gallatin asked Staff for a Roll Call vote:

Commissioner Cross	Yes
Commissioner Ding	Yes
Commissioner Morrish	Yes
Vice-Chair Lopez	Yes
Chair Gallatin	Yes

**Motion carried, 5-0.**

**PUBLIC HEARING**

- 4. **1808 Diamond Avenue, Project No. 2449-COA** – A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a 1,395 square-foot two-story addition with a 380 square-foot rear balcony to an existing one-story, 1,229 square-foot one-story single-family residence with a two-car garage located at 1808 Diamond Avenue (APN: 5319-021-020). In accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the project qualifies for a Categorical Exemption under Section 15301, Class 1 (Existing Facilities) and Section 15331, Class 31 (Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation).

**Recommendation:**

Find the project exempt from CEQA pursuant to Sections 15301 and 15331. Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness, subject to the Conditions of Approval.

**Presentation:**

Associate Planner Madrid presented a PowerPoint presentation.

**Questions for Staff:**

The Commissioners expressed several concerns about the project, including materials to be used for the exterior and clarification regarding the windows. They also discussed the utility and value of a 3D model, which would have been very helpful to their review of this project.

**Applicant Presentation:**

None. However, the Applicant and the Designer, Kenneth Rojas, were available via Zoom to answer any questions.

**Questions for Applicant:**

The Commissioners asked about the large volume in the addition being proposed behind the existing house and the struggle with the subordination component of the development standards, the ceiling height, the specifics of the balcony and porch railing details, the roofing materials and the proposed elevations. Designer Rojas explained the considerations that were made when designing the project.

**Public Comment:**

None.

**Applicant's Rebuttal:**

Designer Rojas clarified the reason for the large balcony and addressed the concerns expressed regarding window placement. He also remarked that the homeowners, listening on Zoom, indicated they would be open to revising the plans.

**Commission Discussion:**

The Commissioners identified and discussed several concerning issues, including the lack of the subordinate nature of the addition to the existing house; the height of the ceiling plate of the second floor; the roof angle; a more subtle differentiation between the wood siding and the stucco; the excessively big balcony; and the lack of detail regarding the railings.

The Commission discussed the benefits a 3D model could offer to their review of this project.

The Commissioners and Designer Rojas discussed exterior materials, including the combination of siding and stucco, and the importance of having transitional elements between the two materials which look pleasing to the eye and not jarring, including transitions between a one-story and a two-story, and also within a two-story mass.

The Commission considered whether the project would benefit from having a subcommittee or if the specific guidance tonight was sufficient. The Commission determined that a subcommittee was not needed.

Associate Planner Madrid confirmed notes were taken of all the comments provided by the Commission tonight. Staff will review the resubmittal to ensure the comments are addressed.

Designer Rojas informed the Commission that the owners indicated to him that they agreed to the Commissioners' comments and suggestions. Chair Gallatin expressed the Commission's thanks and appreciation for their willingness to be flexible.

**Decision:**

Commissioner Morrish moved, seconded by Commissioner Ding, based on the comments made tonight, to continue this item to the next scheduled Cultural Heritage Commission meeting on August 17, 2023 to give the Applicant a chance to review tonight's comments and make changes to the addition, and return to the Commission at that meeting. Some form of 3D modeling is also requested.

Chair Gallatin asked Staff for a Roll Call vote:

Commissioner Cross                      Yes

Commissioner Ding                      Yes

Commissioner Morrish	Yes
Vice-Chair Lopez	Yes
Chair Gallatin	Yes

**Motion carried, 5-0.**

5. **329 Fremont Avenue, Project No. 2552-COA** – A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a 400 square-foot first floor addition at the rear of an existing two-story, 1,912 square-foot single-family residence for the property located at 329 Fremont Avenue (APN: 5317-011-038). In accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the project qualifies for a Categorical Exemption under Section 15301, Class 1 (Existing Facilities) and Section 15331, Class 31 (Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation).

**Recommendation:**

Find the project exempt from CEQA pursuant to Sections 15301 and 15331. Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness, subject to the Conditions of Approval.

**Staff Presentation:**

Assistant Planner Goldberg presented a PowerPoint presentation.

**Questions for Staff:**

None.

**Applicant Presentation:**

None. However, the Applicant and the property owner were present to address any questions or concerns.

**Questions for Applicant:**

Chair Gallatin and Commissioner Morrish inquired about the new windows being proposed. Designer Kristen Boyle explained that the proposed windows would match the existing windows. The Commission appreciated the reuse of the existing windows.

**Public Comment:**

None.

**Applicant Rebuttal:**

None.

**Commission Discussion:**

The Commissioners agreed that it was a well-done project and a good example of compliance to both the Design Standards and the Secretary of Interior's Standards.

**Decision:**

Commissioner Cross moved, seconded by Vice-Chair Lopez, that the project be approved as proposed, with the Conditions and Findings as presented in the Staff Report.

Chair Gallatin asked Staff for a Roll Call vote:

Commissioner Cross	Yes
--------------------	-----

Commissioner Ding	Yes
Commissioner Morrish	Yes
Vice-Chair Lopez	Yes
Chair Gallatin	Yes

**Motion carried, 5-0.**

## ADMINISTRATION

**6. Comments from Council Liaison:**

None.

**7. Comments from Commissioners:**

The Commissioners and Deputy Director Becker discussed the pros and cons of requiring 3D images for all projects, including methods and costs, and specifically for second-story addition projects.

It was determined that a 3D model requirement would be mandatory on projects going from one story to two, as a minimum.

**8. Comments from Subcommittees:**

None.

**9. Comments from Staff:**

Deputy Director Becker reported updates on several items, including officially welcoming Senior Planner Dean Flores to the department; progress of the Draft Program EIR; the advancement of the General Plan and corresponding rezonings through the Planning Commission next month, highlighting there will be two meetings on these topics - August 8 and August 21 - and the hearings will be set for Council in September shortly. She encouraged the Commission to review the plans which were forwarded to them by email and provide comments and suggestions.

Chair Gallatin inquired about any progress toward scheduling of a possible study session on the 45-foot height limit - a follow-up to a resident's question at the workshop held last month at the War Memorial Building.

Deputy Director Becker replied that the City Attorney advised that the department's plans adhere to the 45-foot height limit. In the event a ballot measure is approved by the voters, the City would return with an amendment to the Downtown Specific Plan or General Plan. This does not preclude an Applicant providing affordable housing from exercising state density bonus incentives which would allow them under that circumstance to exceed the height limit.

## ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 8:28 pm to the next regular meeting of the Cultural Heritage Commission on August 17, 2023, at 6:30 pm.

APPROVED,



Mark Gallatin  
Chair, Cultural Heritage Commission

11-16-23

Date