

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE
CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION
CITY OF SOUTH PASADENA, CALIFORNIA
CONVENED THIS 19TH DAY OF SEPTEMBER, 2013
COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 1424 MISSION STREET**

ROLL CALL

The Meeting convened at: 6:50 PM

Commissioners Present: Robert Conte (Chair), John Lesak (Vice Chair),
West J. De Young, Deborah Howell-Ardila and
James McLane

Commissioners Absent: None

Council Liaison Absent: Michael A. Cacciotti, Councilmember

Staff Liaison Present: John Mayer, Senior Planner

NON-AGENDA
PUBLIC COMMENT
PERIOD

1. None

2. **2013 Annual Heritage Preservation Awards**

This item was **CONTINUED** to the November 21, 2013 meeting.

CONTINUED
APPLICATIONS

3. **820 Milan Avenue**
Applicant: Tom Nott, *Architect*
Project #: 1589-COA

Project Description:

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for changing the wood post on the front porch and on the second story balcony within the front of the house. The project was recently granted a Certificate of Appropriateness on February 21, 2013 for a 9 sq. ft. addition, and exterior changes, replacing wood siding panels with James Hardie board panels and replacing stucco siding with James Hardie board panels.

Presentation:

Tom Nott presented his project noting that this project responds to the Commission's previous concerns about simplifying the design of the columns. He responded to questions about the drawings, proposed materials, and the structural connections.

Public Comment:

None

Discussion/Vote:

After review and a brief discussion about changes to the home's front porch, the Commission voted 5-0 (Conte-Howell) to **APPROVE** the project as presented. The project was approved on the findings that it is appropriate to the size, massing, and design context of the historic neighborhood.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the South Pasadena Municipal Code, consideration of the application, and all written and oral testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the property as set forth in the City's Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural

Heritage Commission found and determined that 820 Milan Avenue as it exists, and as it is proposed to be altered, would reasonably meet national, state or local criteria for designation as a landmark or part of an historic district, and is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

4. **613 Meridian Avenue**
Applicant: Joe Venegas, Home Owner
Project #: 1600-COA/DRX

Project Description:

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness and Design Review approval for a front and rear addition to an existing two story home, as well as construction of a new detached 2-car garage with a 196 square foot attached accessory structure. The proposed addition to the front of the house consists of the rebuilding and enlarging of the existing front entry porch, adding 109 square feet and extending it along the front façade, while adding a second floor deck above the front porch. An existing sleeping porch located at the northeast corner of the house is proposed to be enclosed and converted into a bathroom. The proposed rear addition consists of 652 square foot two story addition. Proposed exterior materials consist of lap siding and asphalt shingle roof to match the existing house, and wood dual paned windows.

Presentation:

Kevin Barnes (project architect) presented his project and responded to questions about the original porch and addressed Commissioner comments from the previous meeting.

Public Comment:

None

Discussion/Vote:

After review and a discussion about the expansion of the ground floor porch, the design changes (including the double hipped roof), the second floor balcony being a character defining feature, lack of balance of the front windows, and rationale for the design changes, the Commission voted 5-0 (Conte-DeYoung) to **CONTINUE** the project so that the architect can respond to the Commissioners' concerns about the location of the bathroom, the second story porch, extending the depth of the front porch, correcting inappropriate alterations of the past, double entrances to the house, a height and proportion issue for the garage.

NEW ITEMS

5. **1917 Oak Street**
Applicant: Ron Louie, Applicant
Project #: 1631-COA/DRX

Project Description:

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness and Design Review to construct a 152 two- story addition at the rear of an existing two-story Colonial Revival style house. An existing rear porch would be enclosed resulting in a 52 square foot addition to the first floor. And a 96 square foot second floor addition is proposed to construct a dormer in order to accommodate a new stairway that complies with today's building code. The dormer would not be visible from the street and all exterior materials for the

proposed addition would match that of the existing house.

Presentation:

Ron Louie presented his project and responded to questions about information on the plans.

Public Comment:

Ming Hsu (property owner) explained the reasons for building the addition and made note of some constraints such as an existing swimming pool and oak trees in the rear yard.

Discussion/Vote:

After review and further discussion, the Commission voted 5-0 (Conte-DeYoung) to **CONTINUE** the project so that the architect can respond to the Commissioners' concerns about differentiating the new addition from the original building, attention to design guidelines (Page 36) needed to address lack of articulation, expanses of blank walls, and exceeding the scale and capacity of the house.

6. **1738 Virginia Place**
Applicant: Jesse Hurtado, Applicant
Project #: 1633-COA/DRX

Project Description:

A request for Certificate of Appropriateness for a 309 sq. ft. single story addition and a new 152 sq. ft. second story addition. The site consists of an existing 1,288 sq. ft. single story Craftsman style house on a 5,000 sq. ft. lot. The single story addition will consist of a new kitchen and the new second story addition will consist of a new bedroom with bathroom. The exterior materials will match the existing; asphalt shingles and wood siding. New double hung wood windows are proposed for the addition portion.

Presentation:

Mr. Hurtado presented his project and responded to questions about information on the plans.

Public Comment:

Chuck Cummings (Virginia Place resident) spoke about demographic changes on his street. There are larger families in the small homes on his and urged the Commission to find appropriate ways to allow modifications to these homes so families can stay in this neighborhood.

Mark Williams (neighbor across the street) spoke about his concerns regarding the visibility of the roof line and the quality of the aesthetics by building upward.

Discussion/Vote:

After review and further discussion about the challenges of adding to a small house on a small lot, the Commission voted 5-0 (Conte-DeYoung) to **CONTINUE** the project so that the architect can respond to the Commissioners' concerns about the massing of the second story addition,

and overall design composition.

NEW BUSINESS

7. Review Criteria for Certificates of Appropriateness

Jennifer Trotoux, an architectural historian from Architectural Resources Group in Pasadena presented a talk about the import criteria Commissioners use when evaluating changes to historic resources. Ms. Trotoux spoke about the Secretary of the Interior Standards, the Seven Aspects of Historic Integrity, and the National Register Criteria for Evaluation. She provided a handout describing the criteria and can be used as a reference for use at future meetings.

Ms. Trotoux responded to questions about the CHC's challenges with evaluating historic detached garages, appropriate environmental review, and local versus national historic importance.

8. 630 Stratford Avenue

Mr. Hugh Maguire presented his request for a proposal to add a two-story addition to a single story, 1,181 square foot Colonial Revival/Craftsman style home that has a rating of 5S3.

Discussion:

Commissioner Lesak stated for the record, that he has previously spoken with the applicant about this project and knows this house and the applicant.

Commissioners noted that a "modern" addition could work and cautioned the architect not to design faux history. The new roof peak appears too high and competes with the homes balanced design. Commissioners advised Mr. Maguire to use the design guidelines and that the addition is "visually subordinate" to the modest look of the house.

The Commission provided comments; there were no decisions made about the proposed project.

9. Historic Preservation Ordinance

Staff briefed the Commission on the status of the Preservation Ordinance regarding the "definitions section". The Commission will review the definitions when Staff completes a matrix showing the differences between the old and new definitions. It will provide more details and definitions that other cities use.

COMMUNICATIONS

10. Comments from Council Liaison

None.

11. Comments from Commission

Commissioner DeYoung had some questions for Staff about the Inventory of Cultural Resources and how far back the homes are dated.

Commissioner Howell spoke about the interviews she held with staff for consultants to expand the City-wide Historic Context Statement.

12. **Comments from South Pasadena Preservation Foundation Liaison**
Commissioner Lesak distributed flyers for the historic house tour and city landmarks.

13. **Comments from Staff**
None

MINUTES

14. **Minutes of the regular meeting of January 17, 2013**
The Commission did not vote on the minutes; they were not included in the agenda packet.

15. **Minutes of the regular meeting of June 20, 2013**
The Commission did not vote on the minutes; they were not included in the agenda packet.

16. **Minutes of the regular meeting of August 15, 2013**
The Commission voted 4-0 (DeYoung-McLane, Lesak Absent at this time) to **APPROVE** the minutes

ADJOURNMENT

17. **Meeting Adjourned at 9:50 p.m. to the regular meeting of October 17, 2013.**



Robert Conte, Chair



Date