

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE  
CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION  
CITY OF SOUTH PASADENA, CALIFORNIA  
CONVENED THIS 17<sup>TH</sup> DAY OF AUGUST, 2017  
CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 1424 MISSION STREET**

---

**ROLL CALL**

The Meeting convened at: 6:50 PM

Commissioners Present: Mark Gallatin (Vice-Chair), Steven Friedman, Rebecca Thompson, and John Lesak

Commissioners Absent: None

Council Liaison Present: Robert S. Joe, Councilmember

Staff Liaison Present: John Mayer, Senior Planner

---

**NON-AGENDA  
PUBLIC COMMENT  
PERIOD**

1. None

---

**CONTINUED  
APPLICATIONS**

2. None

---

**NEW ITEMS**

3. **843 Garfield Avenue**  
**Applicant: Jim Fenske, Architect**  
**Project No.: 2007-COA**  
**Historic Status Code: 5D3**

**Project Description:**

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to build a 417 sq. ft. one story addition to an existing 1,250 sq. ft. English Revival house on a 7,217 sq. ft. lot. The addition will consist of a new master bedroom with two closets. The addition will also consist of expanding the existing kitchen. The proposed exterior materials will match the existing, stucco siding and wood windows.

**Presentation:** Jim Fenske (project architect) presented his project and responded to questions about the roof plan, the location of mechanical equipment, and the proposed fixed windows.

**Public Comment:**

None

**Commission Discussion/Decision:**

Commissioners discussed the two fixed windows and a preference for matching the proportions of the existing windows.

Motion/Second (Lesak/Friedman) to **APPROVE** the project with the following **CONDITIONS:** 1). Correct the roof plans that show existing and proposed; 2) correct the south elevation drawing; 3) a chair review for the screening of water heater and air conditioner units on the north elevation. Commissioner Lesak recommended that the applicant drop the head height of the kitchen window on the south elevation to be consistent with the others and convert the fixed window of the bedroom and convert them into a pair of casement windows so that the sashes are more consistent with the other

---

windows.

The project was approved on the findings that it is appropriate to the size, massing, and design context of the historic neighborhood, and the project adds new living space to the rear side of the residence while preserving the single story character of the streetscape.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the South Pasadena Municipal Code, Section 36.410.040 (required findings to approve the design review application which includes the City's adopted design guidelines, consideration of the application, and all written and oral testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the property as set forth in the City's Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural Heritage Commission found and determined that 843 Garfield Avenue as it exists, and as it is proposed to be altered, would reasonably meet national, state or local criteria for designation as a landmark or part of an historic district, and is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

The motion carried 4-0.

---

4. **2024 La France Avenue**  
**Applicant: Jim Fenske, Architect**  
**Project No. 2008-COA**  
**Historic Status Code: 5D1**

**Project Description:**

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to build a new 607 square foot contemporary style, second story addition to an existing 2,018 square foot one story, English Revival house on a 7,217 square foot lot. The second story addition will consist of adding a master bedroom, a master bathroom, a closet, a sitting area, and a study. The proposed exterior materials for the addition will be smooth stucco siding with aluminum windows and doors. The project includes two-second story decks. One deck would be located on the rear elevation at 126 square feet; the other would be on the south elevation at 70 square feet. Both decks would feature guard rails made of steel cable.

**Presentation:**

Jim Fenske (project architect) presented his project and responded to questions about the floor plans, the proposed height, lot coverage, door schedule, and additional errors and inconsistencies with the plans.

**Public Comment:**

Edward Lee was concerned about the contemporary look of the proposed project. Mr. Lee asked about the size and whether it is the maximum size allowed.

**Commission Discussion/Decision:**

Commissioners agreed that the project's design would not be compatible with the neighborhood and it doesn't preserve the home's features and form.

---

The addition appears alien and harsh relative to the home's form. Commissioner Gallatin stated that two issues were in conflict with the City's Design Guidelines and the Secretary of Interior Standards including: 1) the ridge sky lights which is a pronounced feature to be avoided; and 2) the removal of brick which are distinctive materials.

Motion/Second (Friedman/Lesak) to **CONTINUE** the project so that the applicant can re-design the project based on comments received at this meeting.

The motion carried 4-0.

---

5. **919 Columbia Street**  
**Applicant: Denise Tomlan, Architect**  
**Project No.: 2016-COA**  
**Historic Status Code: 2S**

**Project Description:**

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to build a new 450 sq. ft. detached garage with an attached 240 sq. ft. carport and an attached 180 sq. ft. recreation room and an attached 60 sq. ft. restroom on the 14,400 sq. ft. lot. The project includes a request for CHC approval to allow a height of 20'-5" height for the detached garage, which would match the roof pitch of the Queen Anne architectural design of the house. The exterior materials of the garage will be Hardie Board, asphalt shingles, wood-framed windows, and cement finish plaster on the rear elevation.

**Presentation:**

Denise Tomlin (project architect) presented her project and responded to questions about the tile, color, and other details. She also responded to questions about the roof pitch and the possible re-use of original windows from the house. Ms. Tomlin indicated that those windows might not be the correct size for the new structure.

Mr. Mayer responded to questions about the property's Mills Act status and a question about the setback requirements for detached garages.

**Public Comment:** None

**Commission Discussion/Decision:**

Motion/Second (Thompson/Friedman) to **APPROVE** the project with the following **CONDITIONS:** A Chair Review approval shall be granted for the following, prior to submitting plans to plan check: 1) selection of tile; 2) treatment of the new windows; and 3) staff to verify the status of the property's Mills Act Contract.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the South Pasadena Municipal Code, Section 36.410.040 (required findings to approve the design review application which includes the City's adopted design guidelines, consideration of the application, and all written and oral

---

testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the property as set forth in the City's Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural Heritage Commission found and determined that 919 Columbia Street as it exists, and as it is proposed to be altered, would continue to meet the criteria for designation as a landmark and is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

The motion carried 4-0.

---

NEW BUSINESS

6. **2048 Milan Avenue (Conceptual Review)**  
**Applicant:** Tom Nott

Commissioner Gallatin recused himself from this discussion and left the room until the conclusion of this item.

**Description:**

Construct a 1,289 sf. 2-story addition to an existing 2,383 sf. 2-story Craftsman style house built in 1910. The completed house will be 3,622 sf. The addition will have an asphalt roof shingle to match existing. All doors and windows will be wood and match existing construction.

**Presentation:**

Tom Nott presented his proposed project and responded to questions about the floor area ratio and the Sanborn map that shows a small addition to the east elevation.

**Discussion:**

Commissioners made the following remarks: the walls of the addition should have differentiation; do not elongate the addition. Tweak the roof with more modulation. Provide more offset (inward direction) and keep it plain with differentiation. Commissioner Friedman said that the addition to the east elevation was likely a functional appendage and not a character-defining feature.

This item was only for discussion; no decision was made at this time.

---

COMMUNICATIONS

7. **Comments from Council Liaison:**

Councilman Joe spoke about the City Council meeting of August 16. He announced that there would be a special public meeting regarding city-wide elections and re-districting. Regarding the historic resources survey, the Council directed staff to do expanded outreach and noticing to those who would be added to the inventory. The Council also requested information about the total number of properties that would be reviewed by the CHC.

---

8. **Comments from Commission**

Commissioner Lesak said that staff should ensure that the drawings are accurate and that the features included in the brochures are identified for

---

---

review instead of the entire manufacturer booklet. He also requested that staff place an item on the next agenda regarding the Mills Act process. Mr. Lesak said the City needs a consistent format for Mills Act contract applications.

Commissioner Gallatin spoke about a meeting he attended with City staff, the pastor of Mosaic Church, and representatives from the Architectural Resources Group regarding the Rialto Theater's draft historic structure report. The final report will be presented to the Commission when its completed.

---

9. **Comments from Staff**

None.

---

MINUTES

10. **Minutes of the regular meeting of May 18, 2017**

Motion/Second (Gallatin/Thompson) to **APPROVE** the minutes with a minor edit.

The motion carried 3-0 (Lesak abstained).

---

11. **Minutes of the regular meeting of June 15, 2017**

Motion/Second (Gallatin/Thompson) to **APPROVE** the minutes with minor corrections.

The motion carried 3-0 (Lesak abstained).

---

12. **Minutes of the regular meeting of July 20, 2017**

Motion/Second (Gallatin/Thompson) to **APPROVE** the minutes with minor corrections.


The motion carried 4-0.

---

ADJOURNMENT

13. **Meeting Adjourned at 8:30p.m. To the next regular meeting scheduled for September 21, 2017.**

---

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Mark Gallatin, Vice-Chair

11-2-17  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Date