

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE
CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION
CITY OF SOUTH PASADENA, CALIFORNIA
CONVENED THIS 21ST DAY OF SEPTEMBER, 2017
CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 1424 MISSION STREET**

ROLL CALL

The Meeting convened at: 6:50 PM

Commissioners Present: Mark Gallatin (Vice-Chair), Steven Friedman, Rebecca Thompson, and John Lesak

Commissioners Absent: None

Council Liaison Present: Robert S. Joe, Councilmember

Staff Liaison Present: John Mayer, Senior Planner

NON-AGENDA
PUBLIC COMMENT
PERIOD

1. None

CONSENT
CALENDAR

2. None

CONTINUED
APPLICATIONS

3. **2024 La France Avenue**
Applicant: Jim Fenske, Architect
Project No.: 2008-COA
Historic Status Code: 5D1

Project Description:

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to build a new 607 square foot contemporary style, second story addition to an existing 2,018 square foot one story, English Revival house on a 7,217 square foot lot. The second story addition will consist of adding a master bedroom, a master bathroom, a closet, a sitting area, and a study. The proposed exterior materials for the addition will be smooth stucco siding with aluminum windows and doors. The project includes two-second story decks. One deck would be located on the rear elevation at 126 square feet; the other would be on the south elevation at 70 square feet. Both decks would feature guard rails made of steel cable.

Presentation:

Jim Fenske presented his project and responded to questions about the removal of a tree, the west elevation, and the brick. Mr. Fenske confirmed that the existing brick would be kept. He also commented on the numerous errors with the plans and a conflict with the proposed size and the allowed maximum floor area ratio.

Commission Discussion/Decision:

Commissioners lacked confidence in the submitted drawings due to inconsistencies and conceptual nature of the proposal. Commissioners did not believe the project would be compatible with the neighborhood. The Commission confirmed with the applicant that the item could be continued so that Mr. Fenske can first present a draft to the Commission for conceptual design approval. The applicant would then prepare accurate drawings for

that design.

NEW ITEMS

4. **2048 Milan Avenue**
Applicant: Tom Nott, Architect
Project No.: 2025-COA
Historic Status Code: 5D1

Commissioner Gallatin recused himself and left the room until the conclusion of this item.

Project Description:

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to build a 1,188 sf. two-story addition to an existing 2,311 sf. two story Craftsman style house, built in 1910. The first floor addition will be 670 sf. The second floor addition will be 518 sf. The first floor exterior deck will be 228 sf. and the second floor deck will be 162 sf. The completed house will be 3,321 sf. The addition will have an asphalt shingle roof to match existing. All doors and windows will be wood and match existing construction.

Presentation: Tom Nott (project architect) presented his project.

Public Comment:

None

Commission Discussion/Decision:

Motion/Second (Lesak/Thompson) to **APPROVE** the project with the following **CONDITIONS** for staff review and approval: 1) replace the slider window on the south elevation with two square windows; and 2) correct the awkward arrangement with the roof of the bay window (rear elevation) with the balcony above it.

The project was approved on the findings that it is appropriate to the size, massing and design context of the historic neighborhood.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the South Pasadena Municipal Code, Section 36.410.040 (required findings to approve the design review application which includes the City's adopted design guidelines, consideration of the application, and all written and oral testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the property as set forth in the City's Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural Heritage Commission found and determined that 2048 Milan Avenue as it exists, and as it is proposed to be altered, would reasonably meet national, state or local criteria for designation as a landmark or part of an historic district, and is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

The motion carried 4-0.

5. **424-430 Arroyo Drive**
Applicant: Virginia Paca, Architect
Project No.: 2040-COA
Historic Status Code: 5S1

Project Description:

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolished the existing 418 sq. ft. carport with an attached 528 sq. ft. garage that was built in 1958. A new 717 sq. ft. garage with an attached 376 sq. ft. carport. The garage will also consist of a bathroom for the pool. The exterior materials for the garage will consist of stucco siding, metal windows and doors to match the existing house.

Presentation:

Virginia Paca (project architect) presented her project and responded to questions about the floor plans, the proposed height, lot coverage, door schedule, and additional errors and inconsistencies with the plans.

Public Comment:

None.

Commission Discussion/Decision:

Motion/Second (Friedman/Thompson) to **APPROVE** the project as submitted.

The project was approved on the findings that it is appropriate to the size, massing and design context of the neighborhood.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the South Pasadena Municipal Code, Section 36.410.040 (required findings to approve the design review application which includes the City's adopted design guidelines, consideration of the application, and all written and oral testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the property as set forth in the City's Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural Heritage Commission found and determined that 424-430 Arroyo Drive as it exists, and as it is proposed to be altered, would continue to meet the criteria for designation as a landmark and is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

The motion carried 4-0.

NEW BUSINESS

6. **612 Meridian Avenue**
Applicant: Jim Fenske, Architect
Conceptual Review
Historic Status Code: 2D

Description:

A request for a conceptual review in regards to a 749 sq. ft. single story addition to an existing 864 sq. ft. Craftsman style house on a 5,264 sq. ft. lot. The exterior materials will match the existing.

Presentation:

Jim Fenske presented his proposed project and responded to questions and comments about the dormers, the window and door schedule, trees identified for removal, and inconsistencies throughout the plans.

Discussion:

Commissioners noted that the design was going in the right direction. Commissioners had several questions about the project and requested numerous clarifications. Mr. Fenske was advised to make the corrections and ensure the accuracy of the plans. This item was only for discussion; no decision was made at this time.

7. **1920 Edgewood Drive**
Applicant: Jim Fenske, Architect
Conceptual Review
Historic Status Code: 5D1

Description:

A request for a conceptual review to build a single story addition of 883 sq. ft. and a new second floor addition of 1,427 sq. ft. The existing property is developed with a 2,524 sq. ft. Colonial Revival Influence house on a 13,241 sq. ft. lot. The existing garage would be demolished for a new 500 sq. ft. garage with a 200 sq. ft. pool house. The exterior materials will match the existing.

Presentation:

Jim Fenske presented the details of his proposed project and noted that his clients desire more floor space while keeping the backyard space in tact. He asked the Commission if a second story addition would be prohibited.

Discussion:

Commissioners noted that the applicant would need to determine the character defining features of the neighborhood and ensure that his project is compatible with the district. Commissioners recommended that the applicant review the Secretary of the Interior Standards and the Design Guidelines. Visual subordination will be important with this project.

This item was only for discussion; no decision was made at this time.

8. **636 Alta Vista Circle**
Owner: Karen Hallock

This item was heard after item number 10. Mr. Mayer introduced the item noting that the property owner of 636 Alta Vista Circle is requesting a discussion about her property and its proposed inclusion on the Inventory of Historic Resources.

Presentation:

Karen Hallock presented her position. She spoke about her conversation

with the consultant, information on the draft survey, and the criteria used to determine historic significance. She mentioned that the survey didn't identify a specific style, nor was there a noteworthy architect associated with her property. She spoke about the architectural elements of her property including some alterations that would preclude her house from historic merit based on the historic context statement. She requested that her property be removed from the inventory due to the additional restrictions. She wants to build an addition in the future without burdens. Ms. Hallock asserted that the City's preservation ordinance lacks local criteria for identifying her property as eligible for designation.

Discussion:

Commissioners identified the criteria for listing on the Inventory. Commissioner Lesak said that Ms. Hallock might have a case in that it is not the last of its kind, or the best of its kind in the City. Although the property fits within a context, it might not be the most significant in that context. Commissioners requested that this item be scheduled for the CHC's regular meeting October 19th for additional discussion.

9. Mills Act Process

Commissioner Lesak said that the City's Mills Act contract program needs more publicity. The contract process needs to be simplified, a standardized format, and not impose complicated requirements and expectations. He spoke about the application forms used in the Cities of Los Angeles and Pasadena. The application process in those cities could be a model for South Pasadena. Commissioners agreed that staff should modify the current application form based on those examples.

10. Historic Resources Survey & Inventory of Addresses

Mr. Mayer introduced this item noting that the City Council had three main concerns about the recent citywide historic resources survey and Inventory of addresses update. First, the survey contained errors. Second, there are 36 potential districts that do not meet the requirements of the 2014 historic context statement and State status codes. And third, property owners were not adequately notified that their addresses would be added to the Inventory.

Mr. Mayer said that staff is working with the consultant to address the errors in the survey. Staff is also working with the consultant and the City Attorney regarding language that can be used to keep the 36 potential districts in tact. Those 36 districts could remain eligible for historic district status based on the designation criteria in the preservation ordinance and that each district was determined eligible through a valid survey. With respect to outreach, Mr. Mayer said that a special CHC meeting is scheduled for October 12, 2017, which will provide an opportunity for those property owners to speak about the addition of their addresses to the Inventory. The meeting will be advertised in the South Pasadena Review for three consecutive weeks and each owner will receive a certified letter about the meeting.

Mr. Mayer asked the Commissioners to provide comments on the draft

letter, which includes the date and time of the meeting, and a “frequently asked questions” (FAQ) section on the backside of it.

Commissioner Lesak spoke about the three basic conditions that a property needs in order to be considered historic including a historic context, significance within that context, and integrity that is all captured in the Citywide historic context statement. He spoke about the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and how historic properties that are eligible, not registered, are considered protected resources under that law. Commissioner Lesak suggested that the FAQ section of the letter highlight the benefit to those owners in terms of CEQA review.

Commissioners discussed the philosophical differences regarding the purpose of the survey, changes in the way preservationists look at buildings and neighborhoods over time, and that the public has the ultimate authority to decide what stays on the Inventory and what can be removed. Commissioners also discussed how alterations to historic resources resulted in the removal of some potential historic districts.

Public Comment:

Karen Hallock commended the Commission for its outreach efforts, which was lacking previously.

Discussion:

Commissioners agreed that the draft letter was sufficient and that the FAQ section to include mention of the benefit to owners in terms of its identification and saving a step in the CEQA process and that the survey was prepared by a qualified professional. Commissioner Lesak agreed to do an introductory presentation at the October 12, 2017 meeting, followed by the public comment section.

11. CHC Annual Report

Commissioner Gallatin read a draft of the CHC’s annual report for the Fiscal Year 2016-17. The report outlines all of the Commission’s accomplishments from the preceding fiscal year. It will be presented to the City Council on October 4, 2017.

COMMUNICATIONS

12. Comments from Council Liaison:

Councilman Joe provided an update on the district based electoral system maps. He announced that Stephanie DeWolfe was selected as the City’s new city manager and that Paul Riddle is the new fire chief. He spoke about regional transportation issues that will be studied by a consultant. Councilman Joe also announced the date of a public meeting regarding water and sewer rates.

13. Comments from Commission

Commissioners bid farewell to Mr. Mayer who will be leaving the City of South Pasadena for a position with the City of West Hollywood.

14. Comments from Staff

Mr. Mayer thanked the Commissioners for their kind remarks and that he appreciated their expertise and volunteer work on the commission, which

has greatly benefited the City.

MINUTES

15. **Minutes of the regular meeting of August 17, 2017**

The minutes were not completed at this time and will be reviewed at the October 19, 2017 meeting.

ADJOURNMENT

16. **Meeting Adjourned at 9:56p.m. To the Special Meeting scheduled for October 12, 2017.**



Mark Gallatin, Vice-Chair



Date