

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE
CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION
CITY OF SOUTH PASADENA, CALIFORNIA
CONVENED THIS 20TH DAY OF NOVEMBER, 2014
COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 1424 MISSION STREET**

ROLL CALL

The Meeting convened at: 6:45 PM

Commissioners Present: John Lesak (Chair), James McLane (Vice-Chair), Robert Conte, West J. De Young, and Deborah Howell-Ardila

Council Liaison Absent: Michael A. Cacciotti, Councilmember

Staff Liaison Present: John Mayer, Senior Planner

NON-AGENDA
PUBLIC COMMENT
PERIOD

1. None.

CONTINUED
APPLICATIONS

2. None.

NEW ITEMS

3. **1721 Mission Street**
Applicant: Jim Fenske, Architect
Project number: 1756-COA/DRX
Historic Status Code: 5D3

Project Description:

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a 250 sq. ft. wood deck located on the rear elevation. Three new French doors with are proposed on the rear elevation. A total of seven new windows are proposed. The windows will consist of four double hung wood windows, one wood casement window, one fixed glass window on the front elevation, and one casement wood window.

Presentation:

Jim Fenske (project architect) presented his project and responded to questions about the windows. He also responded to some comments about the southwest corner of the house and the front dormer.

Public Comment:

None

Commission Decision:

Motion/Second (Lesak/McLane) to **APPROVE** the project with the **CONDITION** that the window treatment of the front gable be more appropriate to the character of the house, subject to Chair review approval. Commissioner McLane was selected to review the window treatment.

This motion was made on the finding that the project is appropriate to the size, massing, and design context of the historic neighborhood. The project removes inappropriate alterations (aluminum framed windows) of the past.

The motion carried 5-0.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the South Pasadena Municipal Code, Section 36.410.040 (required findings to approve the design review application, consideration of the application, and all written and oral testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the property as set forth in the City's Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural Heritage Commission found and determined that 1721 Mission Street as it exists, and as it is proposed to be altered, would reasonably meet national, state or local criteria for designation as a landmark or part of an historic district, and is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

4. **1822 Mission Street**
Applicant: Jeremiah Kimber
Project number: 1759-COA/DRX
Historic Status Code: 5D1

Project Description:

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a 604 sq. ft. single story addition to an existing 2,041 sq. ft. single story English Revival house on a 12,000 sq. ft. lot. The 604 sq. ft. addition will consist of creating a new kitchen, expanding a new family room, and adding a new laundry room. The existing 345 sq. ft. attached utility room will be increased by 328 sq. ft. creating a new 673 sq. ft. attached garage. All the exterior materials will match the existing exterior materials. The windows will consist of wood windows, stucco siding to match the existing, and composite roof shingles.

Presentation:

Bill Judson and Jeremiah Kimber (Architect Team) presented the project and responded to questions about the windows.

Public Comment:

None

Commission Decision:

Motion/Second (Lesak/De Young) to **APPROVE** the project as submitted. This motion was made on the finding that the project is appropriate to the size, massing, and design context of the historic neighborhood. The project removes inappropriate alterations (jalousie windows) of the past. The project adds substantial new living space to the rear of this corner lot while preserving the historic character of the streetscape.

The motion carried 5-0.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the South Pasadena Municipal Code, Section 36.410.040 (required findings to approve the design review application, consideration of the application, and all written and oral testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the property as set forth in the City's Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural

Heritage Commission found and determined that 1822 Mission Street as it exists, and as it is proposed to be altered, would reasonably meet national, state or local criteria for designation as a landmark or part of an historic district, and is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

5. **1915 Lemman Street**
Applicant: Christian Foster
Project number: 1760-COA/DRX
Historic Status Code: 5D1

Project Description:

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a 233.70 sq. ft. single story addition to an existing 1,958.91 two story Craftsman style house on a 10,037 sq. ft. lot. The addition is located towards the rear of the property and will consist of a new laundry room, half bathroom, and a new rear entry area. A new 150 sq. ft. second story balcony is proposed on the rear of the property. The exterior materials for the addition will match the existing exterior materials.

Presentation:

Christian Foster (project architect) presented her project and responded to questions about the original look of the home's rear side.

Public Comment:

None

Commission Decision:

Motion/Second (Lesak/De Young) to **APPROVE** the project as submitted. This motion was made on the finding that the project is appropriate to the size, massing, and design context of the historic neighborhood. The project adds substantial new living space while preserving the historic character of the streetscape.

The motion carried 5-0.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the South Pasadena Municipal Code, Section 36.410.040 (required findings to approve the design review application, consideration of the application, and all written and oral testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the property as set forth in the City's Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural Heritage Commission found and determined that 1915 Lemman Street as it exists, and as it is proposed to be altered, would reasonably meet national, state or local criteria for designation as a landmark or part of an historic district, and is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

-
6. **307 Fremont Avenue**
Applicant: Erick Molinar
Project number: 1761-COA/DRX
Historic Status Code: 4X
-

Project Description:

A request for Certificate of Appropriateness for a 782 sq. ft. single story addition and 589 sq. ft. second story addition to an existing 2,073 sq. ft. two story English Revival style house on a 15,119 sq. ft. lot. The single story addition will consist of a new kitchen, a new nook, and a new master bedroom. The second story addition will consist of a bedroom, walk-in closet and bathroom. The project will also consist of a guest house with an attached 400 sq. ft. two vehicle garage. The guest house is not subject to the CHC review or approval. However, the CHC may recommend suggestions for the guest house. A 200 sq. ft. carport is being proposed. The proposed exterior materials will match the existing exterior materials.

Presentation:

Eric Molinar (project architect) presented his project and responded to questions about the massing, the second floor plan (including mechanical room), the north elevation drawings, and the river rock wall.

Public Comment:

None.

Commission Decision:

Motion/Second (Lesak/McLane) to **APPROVE** the project with the following **CONDITION:** The applicant shall work with an appointed subcommittee of Commissioners Lesak and McLane to: 1) review modifications to the massing of the addition of the primary building with a three dimensional view; 2) address the blank facades on the north and west facades; 3) provide more information relative to the window and door details; and 4) reconsider some of the design elements and features of the carport.

Commissioner Lesak prefaced the motion stating that the house has been altered over multiple time periods and there are very few original features remaining. The motion was made on the finding that the project is appropriate to the size, massing, and design context of the historic neighborhood. The project adds substantial new living space towards the rear of the property while preserving the character of the streetscape

The motion carried 5-0.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the South Pasadena Municipal Code, Section 36.410.040 (required findings to approve the design review application, consideration of the application, and all written and oral testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the property as set forth in the City's Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural Heritage Commission found and determined that 307 Fremont as it exists, and as it is proposed to be altered, would reasonably meet national, state or local criteria for designation as a landmark or part of an

historic district, and is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

NEW BUSINESS

7. **2069 Milan Avenue**
Prospective Applicant: Rafael Dieppa
Conceptual Review
Historic Status Code: 5D1

Presentation:

Rafael Dieppa solicited comments from the Commission on a proposal to build a 576 square foot single story addition to an existing 1,284 sq. ft. single story Spanish/Mission Revival house. The project would involve demolishing a 324 square foot detached garage for the construction of a new 400 sq. ft. detached garage. The exterior materials for the addition and the garage would match the existing structure.

Discussion:

Commissioners raised questions about why the new garage needs to be set far back. The Architectural Historian's report needs to address how the existing garage relates to the potential historic district. The Commission wants to see the Sanborn Maps of the site to understand the original footprint of the buildings and the neighborhood. A structural engineers report is needed if the owner is claiming the garage is in disrepair. The Commission took no action on the proposed project.

8. **1414 Fair Oaks Avenue**
Mills Act Contract Review

Presentation:

Anito To (property owner) presented her request on behalf of the property owners for a Mills Act contract to restore and prepare the Smith and Williams Building. Ms. To said she owned the building since 2004. She submitted a plan to reconstruct a wood trellis in the rear that was previously demolished. She said that she is not seeking a contract to cover work that was previously done.

Discussion:

Commissioner Lesak said that he and Commissioner Howell-Ardila worked with Ms. To for the past few years regarding this Mills Act contract. The Getty Conservation Institute also visited the site and made some suggestions. Commissioners Lesak and Howell-Ardila recommend the following changes for the Mills Act contract including:

- Treatment of metal canopy to be completed by year 2024 instead of an unspecified date after 2022. The owner must first obtain a Certificate of Appropriateness approval for the owners' plans to rehabilitate the canopy.
 - All wood framed windows to be repaired by year 2020 instead of the unknown dates of when tenants move out. The owner must first obtain a Certificate of Appropriateness about how the wood
-

framed windows will be repaired.

- Prior to starting work on the maintenance/repair of wood features and cement plaster cladding, the owner shall submit a detailed maintenance and repair plan that's prepared and performed by a qualified preservation contractor with credentials. The maintenance/repair plan and contractors' credentials shall be first reviewed by the Chairperson of the Commission.

Anita To asked for flexibility with the Commission's fixed deadlines due to the potential of her cost estimates to change over time. She expressed concerns about the unknowns of replicating the unique steel pattern of the canopy.

Commissioner Lesak noted that the owners have the flexibility to choose among several options about how to "treat" the canopy. The owners' selected treatment plan must be approved by the Commission and implemented in 10 years.

Commissioner Howell-Ardila asked Ms. To how much money the owners will invest into the property relative to the amount saved and if she can break down the amounts for each item.

Anita To said that the landscaping work is \$33,000 and estimate for canopy treatment is \$89,000 amounting to \$122,000. The owners' tax savings over the 10 year life of the contract is approximately \$180,000. Anita To said that there will be other expenses including window restoration. Anita To continued to express concerns about the unknown future costs of the canopy treatment and committing to a firm deadline.

Commissioner Lesak said that the owners will need to notify the Commission if the canopy treatment becomes cost-prohibitive and find ways to resolve the matter. The Commission should recognize that the price of materials and labor will change over time.

Commissioner Conte expressed concerns about recommending approval of a Mills Act contract that does not guarantee a repair of the canopy which is considered the main feature of the building.

Commissioner Lesak said that the required reporting procedures in the Mills Act contract obligate the owners to identify any issues (i.e. unexpected change in costs) that may arise during the life of the contract. At that time, the Commission can work with the owners on a solution.

Anita To said that the owners intend to repair the canopy, but has not yet found the most "appropriate" way to do it.

Commissioner Howell-Ardila said she believes the owner will repair the canopy because the contract penalties of not doing it are severe.

Commissioner Conte asked why there is a landscaping component and whether this would be considered regular maintenance. Commissioners Lesak and Howell-Ardila responded that the landscaping is an integral part of the landmark property. The original landscape plan will be implemented.

Anita To said that she previously reviewed Commissioners' comments

and agrees to make those changes. She also understands that the contract will not renew after six years.

Commissioner Howell-Ardila suggested that the owners consider preparing a Historic Structures Report as a starting point to identify all of the maintenance and repair issues that need to be addressed.

Commission Action:

Motion/Second (Lesak/Howell-Ardila) to **RECOMMEND APPROVAL** of the proposed Mills Act contract to the City Council. The proposed contract shall be modified to address the Commissioners requested changes at tonight's meeting and outlined in the subcommittee's memo. The owners shall also submit a clear summary of capitalized costs versus tax benefits. The notice of non-renewal after year 5 shall also be included.

The motion carried 5-0.

9. **325 Monterey Road
Mills Act Contract Review**

Commissioner Lesak recused himself and left the room when this item was called. His firm prepared the paperwork that the Commission was about to review.

Presentation:

Sergio Santino (property owner) requested that the Commission consider the complexities of restoring the Fleet House and a recommendation to the City Council for a Mills Act Contract. Mr. Santino said that the cost estimates were revised to reflect current conditions; previous estimates were five years old.

Discussion:

Vice Chair McLane said that he previously visited the Fleet House. He reiterated the importance of the restoring the structure and thanked Mr. Santino for his efforts.

Commissioner McLane asked that the Commission discuss the HVAC and conduit removal items and whether they merit tax relief. He did not consider those items as important as some of the larger issues. Commissioners agreed that those items can be omitted because his investment exceeds the amount saved with property taxes.

Commissioner McLane noted that interior improvements are not typically included; however, in this case the Commission should support them because they are integrated with the structure's uniqueness.

Commissioner McLane also said that work on the surrounding grounds is not typically included, but the trees are interfering with the structure and water is draining towards it threatening damage.

Commission Action:

Motion/Second (McLane/Howell-Ardila) to **RECOMMEND APPROVAL** of the proposed Mills Act contract to the City Council. The proposed contract shall be modified to omit the HVAC equipment and conduit removal. The notice of non-renewal after year 5 shall also be included.

The motion carried 5-0.

10. **844 Monterey Road
Mills Act Contract Review**

Presentation:

Glen Eddy (property owner) spoke about his request for a Mills Act contract to rehabilitate his home at 840 Monterey Road. It is City Landmark No. 40 which is known as the Washburn House. Mr. Eddy has been the owner since 2006. He responded to questions about general upkeep work that he has done since then. Mr. Eddy also responded to questions to clarify certain items in the work program.

Discussion:

Commissioner McLane suggested that this house is a good candidate for a Mills Act contract because it's a modest example of a craftsman style house that has retained its original materials. The proposed work plan includes repairs to: the roof, exterior wood cladding, chimney, windows, and a door.

Commissioners discussed the roofing and exterior materials for clarification and edits needed in the rehabilitation and preservation plan. Commissioners also discussed several work items to determine whether they merit Mills Act tax relief.

Commissioners agreed that the proposed maintenance and rehabilitation work plan is a good comprehensive strategy and investment that will keep the house in good condition well into the future.

Commission Action:

Motion/Second (McLane/De Young) to **RECOMMEND APPROVAL** of the proposed Mills Act contract to the City Council. The proposed contract shall address the following issues:

- The maintenance plan should include exterior paint and repair for the house and garage,
 - The maintenance plan should address storm water control to include roof runoff, gutters, rain water leaders, French drains, storm water dispersal to the appropriate means of treatment,
 - Omit floor repair for the rear addition from the capitalized expenses and
 - Total of capitalized expenses should meet or exceed the estimated tax savings.
-

- Automatic renewal of the Mills Act contract should end after five years.
- The maintenance plans shall be reviewed by the Commission prior to the starting work.

The motion carried 4-0, Conte Abstained.

11. **1115 Montrose Ave**
Applicant: Allan Zorthian
Conceptual Review
Historic Status Code: 5D1

Presentation:

Allan Zorthian (prospective applicant) solicited comments for an addition to a 1,834 square foot Craftsman style home. The project would involve a 530 square foot addition to the first floor and a 1,900 square foot second floor addition. He asked for comments on two options for a roof dormer that would project from the second story bedroom and would be visible from the front of the house.

Discussion:

Commissioners referred Mr. Zorthian to the City's Design Guidelines for Historic Homes. The proposed massing needs to be shifted towards the back of the house. Commissioners noted that the proposed addition should be visually subordinate to the original house. This house is a contributor to potential historic district.

The Commission took no action on this item.

12. **Preservation Ordinance**

Discussion:

Commissioners discussed the City Council's review of the draft preservation ordinance that was held on Wednesday November 19, 2014.

Commissioners wish to keep the momentum going with the ordinance. Commissioners were concerned about the City Council's reaction to Inventory updates. Commissioners also discussed Councilmember Schneider's suggestion about disclosing information to homebuyers about their status on the Inventory.

The Commission took no action on this item.

COMMUNICATIONS

13. **Comments from Council Liaison**

None

14. **Comments from Commission**

Commissioner Howell-Ardila spoke about the Historic Context Statement

and that the consultant will change the language to clarify that the city's districts are intact and that certain alterations should be avoided in the future.

Commissioner Conte wants the CHC to discuss a strategy for closing out current Mills Act contracts.

15. Comments from South Pasadena Preservation Foundation Liaison

None

16. Comments from Staff

None


MINUTES

17. Minutes of the special meeting of November , 2014

Motion/Second (Lesak/De Young) to **APPROVE** the Minutes with minor edits. The Motion carried 5-0.

ADJOURNMENT

18. Meeting Adjourned at 10:30 p.m. to the regularly scheduled meeting of December 18, 2014.



John Lesak, Chair

Date

DEC. 18, 2014