



**CITY OF SOUTH PASADENA  
PUBLIC SAFETY COMMISSION SPECIAL MEETING AGENDA**

**CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS  
1424 MISSION STREET, SOUTH PASADENA, CA 91030  
VIA HYBRID / IN-PERSON**

**Monday, October 17, 2022 at 8:30 a.m.**

**South Pasadena Public Safety Commission Statement of Civility**

*As your appointed governing board, we will treat each other, members of the public, and city employees with patience, civility and courtesy as a model of the same behavior we wish to reflect in South Pasadena for the conduct of all city business and community participation. The decisions made today will be for the benefit of the South Pasadena community and not for personal gain.*

**NOTICE ON PUBLIC PARTICIPATION & ACCESSIBILITY**

The South Pasadena Public Safety Commission Meeting will be conducted in-person from the Council Chambers, Amedee O. "Dick" Richards, Jr., located at 1424 Mission Street, South Pasadena. Pursuant to AB 361 Government Code section 54953, subdivision (e)(3), the Advisory Body may conduct its meetings remotely and may be held via video conference.

The Public Safety Commission Meeting for **October 17, 2022** will be conducted hybrid via zoom teleconference and in-person.

Please be advised that pursuant to government code, and to ensure the health and safety of the public, staff, and Commissioners, the Council Chambers will be open to the public for the meeting and members of the public may attend and/or participate by the following means:

The Meeting will be available:

- Via Zoom – **Meeting ID: 841 9322 6718**
- Zoom Link – <https://us06web.zoom.us/j/84193226718>

To maximize public safety while still maintaining transparency and public access, members of the public can observe the meeting via Zoom in one of the methods below:

1. Go to the Zoom website, <https://zoom.us/join> and enter the Zoom Meeting information; or
2. Click on the following unique Zoom Meeting link: <https://us06web.zoom.us/j/84193226718>
3. You may listen to the meeting by calling: +1-669-900-6833 and entering the Zoom Meeting ID

For additional Zoom assistance with telephone audio, you may find your local number at:

<https://zoom.us/u/aiXV0TAW2>

**CALL TO ORDER**

**ROLL CALL**

Commissioners Walter Cervantes, Bethesda Gee, Jeremy Ding, Amin Alsarraf, Vice Chair Lisa Watson, Chair Ed Donnelly

**COUNCIL LIAISON:**

Councilmember Jon Primuth

## **PUBLIC COMMENT AND SUGGESTIONS**

The City Council welcomes public input. If you would like to comment on an agenda item, members of the public may participate **by means of one of the following options:**

### Option 1:

Participants will be able to “raise their hand” using the Zoom icon during the meeting, and they will have their microphone un-muted during comment portions of the agenda to speak for up to 3 minutes per item.

### Option 2:

Email public comment(s) to [pscpubliccomment@southpasadenaca.gov](mailto:pscpubliccomment@southpasadenaca.gov).

Public Comments received in writing will not be read aloud at the meeting, but will be part of the meeting record. Written public comments will be uploaded online for public viewing under Additional Documents. There is no word limit on emailed Public Comment(s). Please make sure to indicate:

- 1) Agenda item you are submitting public comment on.
- 2) Submit by no later than 6:00pm October 16, 2022.

*NOTE: Pursuant to State law, the Commission may not discuss or take action on issues not on the meeting agenda, except that members of the Commission or staff may briefly respond to statements made or questions posed by persons exercising public testimony rights (Government Code Section 54954.2). Staff may be asked to follow up on such items.*

## **1. Public Comment**

## **ACTION/DISCUSSION**

### **2. Minutes of the Public Safety Commission Meeting of September 12, 2022**

Consideration of the minutes of the Public Safety Commission regular meeting of September 12, 2022.

### **3. Flock Camera System**

Review of potential Automated License Plate Reader System.

## **INFORMATION REPORTS**

No items.

## **COMMUNICATIONS**

### **4. City Council Liaison Communications**

### **5. Staff Liaison Communications**

### **8. Commissioner Communications**

## **ADJOURNMENT**

**PUBLIC ACCESS TO AGENDA DOCUMENTS**

The complete agenda packet may be viewed on the City's website, [www.southpasadenaca.gov](http://www.southpasadenaca.gov).

Meeting recordings will be available for public viewing after the meeting. Recordings will be uploaded to the City's YouTube Channel no later than the next business day after the meeting. The City's YouTube Channel may be accessed at: [https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCnR169ohzi1AlewD\\_6sfwDA/featured](https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCnR169ohzi1AlewD_6sfwDA/featured)

**ACCOMMODATIONS**

The City of South Pasadena wishes to make all of its public meetings accessible to the public. If special assistance is needed to participate in this meeting, please contact the City Clerk's Division via e-mail at [CityClerk@southpasadenaca.gov](mailto:CityClerk@southpasadenaca.gov) or by calling (626) 403- 7230. Upon request, this agenda will be made available in appropriate alternative formats to persons with disabilities. Notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will assist staff in assuring that reasonable arrangements can be made to provide accessibility to the meeting (28 CFR 35.102-35.104 ADA Title II).

*I declare under penalty of perjury that I posted this notice of agenda on the bulletin board in the courtyard of City Hall at 1414 Mission Street, South Pasadena, CA, and the City's website at [www.southpasadenaca.gov](http://www.southpasadenaca.gov) on **October 13, 2022** as required by law.*

October 13, 2022

Date



Brian Solinsky, Chief of Police



**CITY OF SOUTH PASADENA**  
VIA HYBRID / IN-PERSON  
CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS  
1424 MISSION STREET, SOUTH PASADENA, CA 91030

**PUBLIC SAFETY COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING MINUTES**  
Monday, September 12, 2022 at 8:30 a.m.

**CALL TO ORDER**

Date/Time: September 12, 2022 / 8:34 a.m.

**ROLL CALL**

Commissioners Present: Commissioners Cervantes, Gee, Ding, Vice Chair Watson, Chair Donnelly

Commissioners Absent: Commissioner Alsarraf

Officials Present: Mayor Pro Tem Primuth, Police Chief Brian Solinsky, Fire Chief Paul Riddle, and Police Department Clerk Nelly Ochoa

Officials Absent: Management Analyst Alison Wehrle and Police Department Clerk/Recording Secretary Laura Mendez

**PUBLIC COMMENTS AND SUGGESTIONS**

1. **Public Comment:** Casey Law

Written public comment was also submitted by Josh Betta and Chris Bray.

**ACTION/DISCUSSION**

2. **Minutes of the Public Safety Commission Meeting of August 8, 2022**

Motion: MOTION BY COMMISSIONER WATSON, AND SECOND BY COMMISSIONER CERVANTES, CARRIED 5-0, to approve the Minutes of the August 8, 2022 Public Safety Commission Regular Meeting as presented.

Ayes: Commissioners Cervantes, Gee, Ding, Vice Chair Watson, Chair Donnelly

Noes: None

Abstain: None

3. **School Safety**

Sergeant Andrew Dubois gave a brief presentation on active school shooters and discussed how shooting incidents can carry over to businesses and other buildings within the community. Sergeant Dubois also described how the South Pasadena Police

Department is equipped to respond to such incidents, including mutual aid response provided by outside agencies.

*Commissioner Gee left the dais at 9:03am and returned at 9:05am via Zoom.*

## **INFORMATION REPORTS**

### **4. Disaster Preparedness**

Fire Chief Paul Riddle provided follow-up information on the anticipated presentation of the Emergency Operations Plan before the City Council on October 19, 2022 and gave a quick overview on the process in the event of a disaster. A variety of mock disaster scenarios are completed by city staff to help prepare for disaster emergencies.

## **COMMUNICATIONS**

### **5. City Council Liaison Communications**

Mayor Pro Tem Primuth addressed items brought to the City Council on September 7, 2022, including City financial policies. The Mayor Pro Tem also mentioned that the City Council has discussed the approval of accommodation to construct a float in the War Memorial parking lot for the Tournament of Roses Parade.

### **6. Staff Liaison Communications**

Police Chief Brian Solinsky gave an update on the completion of the investigation for a recent traffic collision. An update was also given on Police Department staff openings and Concealed Carry Weapon permits. Police Chief Brian Solinsky reminded the public about the citywide Open House event on October 2, 2022. Fire Chief Paul Riddle provided information on the Fire Department's recruitment efforts, and shared information on the Department's Paramedic Subscription Program.

### **7. Commissioner Communications**

Commissioner Gee expressed interest in speaking before the school board regarding school safety as a private citizen. Commissioner Cervantes commented on public comments received by the Commission. Chair Donnelly encouraged the community to approve critical funding for the South Pasadena Library.

## **ADJOURNMENT**

Date/Time: September 12, 2022 / 10:05 a.m.

Respectfully Submitted:

Approved By:

---

Nelly Ochoa  
Recording Secretary

---

Ed Donnelly  
Chair



# Public Safety Commission Agenda Report

ITEM NO. 3

**DATE:** October 17, 2022

**FROM:** Brian Solinsky, Chief of Police  
Alison Wehrle, Management Analyst

**SUBJECT:** **Flock Camera System**

---

## Recommendation

It is recommended that the Public Safety Commission:

1. Review a potential Automated License Plate Reader (ALPR) camera system; and
2. Provide a recommendation to the City Council regarding endorsement of an ALPR camera system.

## Background

The Police Department was allocated funding for the 2022-2023 Fiscal Year intended for the development of an Automated License Plate Reader (ALPR) camera system within the City. The Public Safety Commission will not be reviewing deployment locations, nor financial data related to the project, but staff is seeking direction from the Commission on whether to proceed with the project. Flock Safety was founded in 2017, and specializes in ALPR technology for law enforcement agencies and neighborhood associations. ALPR cameras, which may be mobile or stationary, are positioned to capture objective data available through still images of the front and/or rear of vehicles and their license plates as they pass within close proximity of the cameras. The images are converted into alphanumeric characters and then compared against databases that contain identifying vehicle information associated with criminal investigations.

The Flock camera system does not capture data or images of the vehicle's occupants, nor does it capture streaming video or audio clips. Given the parameters of the image collection, some communities have sought these type of systems to reduce the potential for negative interactions between motorists and law enforcement as the information and the means obtained is not considered intrusive or biased. The use of this type of technology is consistent with President Obama's Task Force on 21<sup>st</sup> Century Policing, Pillar Three – Technology and Social Media: The use of technology can improve policing practices and build community trust and legitimacy, but its implementation must be built on a defined policy framework with purposes and goals clearly delineated.

The South Pasadena Police Department has been deploying mobile ALPR technology since 2013. The item was originally brought before City Council at the February 20, 2013 regular Council meeting and approved for purchase and implementation.

As required by California Civil Code 1798.90.51, public agencies using ALPR technology must adopt a usage and privacy policy to ensure that the collection, use, maintenance, sharing, and dissemination of ALPR information is consistent with respect for individuals' privacy, security, and civil liberties. Civil Code Section 1798.90.55 also requires that the public agency provide an opportunity for the public to review and comment on this policy at a City Council meeting. The existing policy governing the use of ALPRs is pursuant to Police Department Duty Manual Section 430, which establishes the usage, storage, dissemination and retention of ALPR data. The Police Department trains its personnel in the proper usage of the ALPR system and secure storage of all data associated with the system.

### **Analysis**

The Flock system entails deploying purposefully placed cameras throughout the City to provide increased coverage and detailed information to law enforcement as both a crime deterrent and investigative tool.

ALPR cameras can assist law enforcement by capturing and comparing license plate data to criminal justice databases in order to detect stolen vehicles, identify wanted persons, collect evidence for criminal prosecution, and monitor Amber or Silver Alerts. When a wanted vehicle is identified, an alert is sent to the communication center and patrol officers in the field for an immediate response. Flock's integrated technology will also allow for searchable descriptors to be queried, such as the vehicle type, make, color, license plate (partial, missing, or covered plates), temporary plates, and license plate state.

Staff recommends beginning with 13 stationary cameras, positioned within the City at ingress and egress locations. Police Department staff will identify locations as major thoroughfares and intersections while providing optimum effectiveness in capturing ALPR data from the public right of way. Locations will also be determined from public discussions and consideration of neighboring cities and the placement of their Flock systems, in order to reduce redundancies. Flock cameras can capture up to two lanes of traffic heading in a single direction.

Flock ALPR cameras have been implemented across the nation and within local regions in more than 270 cities, including San Marino, Alhambra, Pasadena, San Gabriel, Arcadia, and Los Angeles County. These entities have reported significant crime reductions and performance satisfaction using Flock ALPRs. The San Marino Police Department reported a 70% reduction in larceny crimes within the first year of use. In 2021, the Huntington Beach Police Department reported 291 hits that resulted in 51 arrests. Other cities have reported an 80% reduction in burglaries or other crimes.

Several local cities have agreements to share information via the Flock system. Information sharing enhances service, reduces costs, and creates a force multiplier by utilizing hundreds of cameras instead of only the thirteen staff recommends.

All data is permanently deleted after 30 days, a built-in feature of the Flock system. It is recommended for all public agencies and staff concurs that data should be stored for up to one year. A year of storage comes at an additional price of \$300 per camera. All data obtained is owned by the City. Flock would not have access to view or monitor footage without the explicit request of the City. However, Flock has the ability to measure camera performance and image-capture quality. This is used preemptively to diagnose issues and schedule maintenance service calls.

Flock ALPR footage, data, and metadata are encrypted throughout its entire lifecycle and are therefore secure from the initial image capture point to its transfer to the cloud. The encryption, AES256-bit encryption, is the same encryption algorithm used by the National Security Agency for top-secret information and is Criminal Justice Information Services (CJIS) compliant.

The closest competitor to Flock is Vigilant Systems (Vigilant), which is owned by Motorola Solutions, Inc. While some cities in Southern California are also using Vigilant, none of them are adjacent to South Pasadena. Vigilant also requires a significant up-front cost to purchase and install the hardware, in addition to a power supply source.

Attachment A: South Pasadena Police Department Duty Manual Section 430 – Automated License Plate Reader (ALPR)



# **ATTACHMENT A**

South Pasadena Police Department Duty Manual Section  
430 – Automated License Plate Reader (ALPR)

## Automated License Plate Readers (ALPRs)

### 430.1 PURPOSE AND SCOPE

The purpose of this policy is to provide guidance for the capture, storage and use of digital data obtained through the use of Automated License Plate Reader (ALPR) technology.

### 430.2 ADMINISTRATION

The ALPR technology, also known as License Plate Recognition (LPR), allows for the automated detection of license plates. It is used by the South Pasadena Police Department to convert data associated with vehicle license plates for official law enforcement purposes, including identifying stolen or wanted vehicles, stolen license plates and missing persons. It may also be used to gather information related to active warrants, homeland security, electronic surveillance, suspect interdiction and stolen property recovery.

All installation and maintenance of ALPR equipment, as well as ALPR data retention and access, shall be managed by the Support Services Division Commander. The Support Services Division Commander will assign members under his/her command to administer the day-to-day operation of the ALPR equipment and data.

#### 430.2.1 ALPR ADMINISTRATOR

The Support Services Division Commander shall be responsible for developing guidelines and procedures to comply with the requirements of Civil Code § 1798.90.5 et seq. This includes, but is not limited to (Civil Code § 1798.90.51; Civil Code § 1798.90.53):

- (a) A description of the job title or other designation of the members and independent contractors who are authorized to use or access the ALPR system or to collect ALPR information.
- (b) Training requirements for authorized users.
- (c) A description of how the ALPR system will be monitored to ensure the security of the information and compliance with applicable privacy laws.
- (d) Procedures for system operators to maintain records of access in compliance with Civil Code § 1798.90.52.
- (e) The title and name of the current designee in overseeing the ALPR operation.
- (f) Working with the Custodian of Records on the retention and destruction of ALPR data.
- (g) Ensuring this policy and related procedures are conspicuously posted on the department's website.

### 430.3 OPERATIONS

Use of an ALPR is restricted to the purposes outlined below. Department members shall not use, or allow others to use the equipment or database records for any unauthorized purpose (Civil Code § 1798.90.51; Civil Code § 1798.90.53).

- (a) An ALPR shall only be used for official law enforcement business.

# South Pasadena Police Department

South Pasadena PD CA Policy Manual

## *Automated License Plate Readers (ALPRs)*

---

- (b) An ALPR may be used in conjunction with any routine patrol operation or criminal investigation. Reasonable suspicion or probable cause is not required before using an ALPR.
- (c) While an ALPR may be used to canvass license plates around any crime scene, particular consideration should be given to using ALPR-equipped cars to canvass areas around homicides, shootings and other major incidents. Partial license plates reported during major crimes should be entered into the ALPR system in an attempt to identify suspect vehicles.
- (d) No member of this department shall operate ALPR equipment or access ALPR data without first completing department-approved training.
- (e) No ALPR operator may access department, state or federal data unless otherwise authorized to do so.
- (f) If practicable, the officer should verify an ALPR response through the California Law Enforcement Telecommunications System (CLETS) before taking enforcement action that is based solely on an ALPR alert.

### **430.4 DATA COLLECTION AND RETENTION**

The Support Services Division Commander is responsible for ensuring systems and processes are in place for the proper collection and retention of ALPR data. Data will be transferred from vehicles to the designated storage in accordance with department procedures.

All ALPR data downloaded to the server should be stored for a minimum of one year (Government Code § 34090.6) and in accordance with the established records retention schedule. Thereafter, ALPR data should be purged unless it has become, or it is reasonable to believe it will become, evidence in a criminal or civil action or is subject to a discovery request or other lawful action to produce records. In those circumstances the applicable data should be downloaded from the server onto portable media and booked into evidence.

### **430.5 ACCOUNTABILITY**

All data will be closely safeguarded and protected by both procedural and technological means. The South Pasadena Police Department will observe the following safeguards regarding access to and use of stored data (Civil Code § 1798.90.51; Civil Code § 1798.90.53):

- (a) All ALPR data downloaded to the mobile workstation and in storage shall be accessible only through a login/password-protected system capable of documenting all access of information by name, date and time (Civil Code § 1798.90.52).
- (b) Members approved to access ALPR data under these guidelines are permitted to access the data for legitimate law enforcement purposes only, such as when the data relate to a specific criminal investigation or department-related civil or administrative action.

# South Pasadena Police Department

South Pasadena PD CA Policy Manual

## *Automated License Plate Readers (ALPRs)*

---

- (c) ALPR system audits should be conducted on a regular basis.

For security or data breaches, see the Records Release and Maintenance Policy.

### **430.6 TRAINING**

The Support Services Commander should ensure that members receive department-approved training for those authorized to use or access the ALPR system (Civil Code § 1798.90.51; Civil Code § 1798.90.53).

### **430.7 POLICY**

The policy of the South Pasadena Police Department is to utilize ALPR technology to capture and store digital license plate data and images while recognizing the established privacy rights of the public.

All data and images gathered by the ALPR are for the official use of this department. Because such data may contain confidential information, it is not open to public review.

### **430.8 RELEASING ALPR DATA**

The ALPR data may be shared only with other law enforcement or prosecutorial agencies for official law enforcement purposes or as otherwise permitted by law, using the following procedures:

- (a) The agency makes a written request for the ALPR data that includes:
  1. The name of the agency.
  2. The name of the person requesting.
  3. The intended purpose of obtaining the information.
- (b) The request is reviewed by the Support Services Division Commander or the authorized designee and approved before the request is fulfilled.
- (c) The approved request is retained on file.

Requests for ALPR data by non-law enforcement or non-prosecutorial agencies will be processed as provided in the Records Maintenance and Release Policy (Civil Code § 1798.90.55).

# ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS

## **Written Public Comment #1 – E-mail Thread**

Good morning Alan,

Thank you for reaching out regarding the Covid-19 After Action Review/Report (AAR). I wanted to follow up with you and provide an update as to the status of the AAR. Division Chief Zanteson and I have been preparing the report and have a draft that we anticipate will be brought before the City Council in early 2023. Typically, an AAR is not completed until the “Incident “ is closed out, in which agencies would have 90 days from that point to complete a report. Given that we are not sure when FEMA will close out the Covid-19 Incident, we still plan on submitting the report in 2023.

In addition to the City’s Emergency Operations Plan, we are also in the progress of updating the City’s Local Hazard Mitigation Plan (LHMP). As you pointed out, we are evaluating the draft AAR as we prepare/update both plans. You have highlighted very good “Benchmark’s” below and I have shared them with Chief Zanteson.

I certainly do recall working with you and Amin on the PSC Ad Hoc Sub-Committee and appreciate all the support through the early part of the Pandemic! I am available to discuss the AAR further over a cup of firehouse coffee as your schedule allows.

Thanks Alan .

Respectfully,

**Paul Riddle**

Fire Chief

City of South Pasadena

[priddle@southpasadenaca.gov](mailto:priddle@southpasadenaca.gov)



**From:** Alan Ehrlich <[Alan.Ehrlich@mail.com](mailto:Alan.Ehrlich@mail.com)>

**Sent:** Tuesday, September 13, 2022 7:30 PM

**Subject:** Public Comment - COVID Emergency After Action Report

Hi Paul, Brian. Ed,

As the SARS Covid-19 evolves from the emergency pandemic phase to endemic phase, this is a request for the PSC, emergency response personnel and city officials to prepare an after action report recapping and analyzing the city's response & handling to this public health emergency. As the city is also in process of reviewing a new EOP, the AAR should evaluate and analyze how well the city's response conformed with the then existing EOP and whether the new EOP addresses any potential deficiencies that may be identified in the AAR.

As you may recall, Amin and I were asked to serve on the PSC Covid Ad Hoc Subcommittee. I began asking for 'interim' AAR's while I was still a PSC commissioner in 2020, while the information about the city's response was still fresh and key personnel in place. Some of the items I hope to see addressed include:

- Information, communications & community outreach
- Information, communications & community outreach
- South Pasadena Convalescent Care Center
- Griffins of Kinsale
- The Barkley
- Personal Services businesses (hair, nail salons)
- Information, communications & community outreach
- Transition to virtual work / virtual public meetings
- Reopening of City Hall
- Information, communications & community outreach
- Role of the (then) city manager
- Role of the (then) mayor
- Role of the (then) city council
- ICS
- Information, communications & community outreach
- Conflicts between city vs county vs state health recommendations, orders, and mandates
- Essential Workers / workplace safety
- Information, communications & community outreach
- Local Business Community
- Rent Relief
- Alfresco program
- Information, communications & community outreach
- Recoverable costs
- Information, communications & community outreach

While the city can point to many successes in its' response, as with any incident, there were also areas of response with room for improvement. A honest and candid AAR can only help the city to become better prepared for the next emergency.

Thank you, Alan

"Sunlight is said to be the best of disinfectants."

- Supreme Court Justice Louis Brandeis

-

"Openness in government is essential to the functioning of a democracy."

International Federation of Professional & Technical Engineers, Local 21 v. Superior Court  
California Supreme Court, 42 Cal.4th 319 (2007)





October 17, 2022  
General Public Comment  
Public Safety Commission

Dear Commissioners:

**Please agendize a presentation and discussion regarding Professors Harris and Rodnyansky's [report](#) about arrest and dispatch trends in South Pasadena at the next Public Safety Commission meeting.**

In August, 2022, Professors Jorgen Harris and Seva Rodnyansky, from the Urban & Environmental Policy Institute at Occidental College, released a report regarding arrests and dispatch activity in South Pasadena. The report was based on five years of dispatch records and ten years of arrest reports the City provided Care First South Pasadena pursuant to the California Public Records Act.

The report found that SPPD has reduced its rate of arrests, particularly for non-violent crimes, in line with regional trends. The report also found that Black and Latinx people are overrepresented among arrestees relative to their population in South Pasadena.

On August 15, 2022, Care First South Pasadena welcomed city leaders and residents to hear a presentation of the report's methodology and findings at Occidental College. Dozens of community members attended in person and virtually. However, there was another event the same evening, which prevented some from attending Professor Harris's presentation.

Since the report's release, we understand there have been some questions about the report's methodology, and some theories offered to explain the racial disparities in arrest patterns identified in the report.

**The report warrants a presentation by the its authors, with an opportunity for questions and discussion in an open forum, involving city staff and commissioners.** There, the community can hear from the Chief and other city leaders directly; they can provide context about the complete picture surrounding the data and findings.

We appreciate that the City is undertaking an operational assessment of the police department. The Public Safety Commission gaining a better understanding of the report's data sources, methodology, findings, and limitations will advance the goals of the assessment, *i.e.*, increased transparency about the Department's operations and any areas of improvement, through a lens of social and racial justice.